

IEEE 802.16 Working Group on Broadband Wireless Access



<http://WirelessMAN.org>

Dr. Roger B. Marks, Chair
325 Broadway, MC 813.00
Boulder, CO 80305 USA
Tel: +1 303 497 3037
<mailto:r.b.marks@ieee.org>
19 November 2003

Dear IEEE-SA RevCom:

This submittal is an application for approval of P802.16.2-REVa (“Draft IEEE Recommended Practice for Local and Metropolitan Area Networks Coexistence of Fixed Broadband Wireless Access Systems”).

Attached to this letter, please find the following:

Page 2-5: IEEE-SA Standards Board Form for Submittal of Proposed Standards
Page 6-11: Summary of initial ballot results
Page 12: First Recirculation ballot cover letter
Page 13-18: First Recirculation ballot results
Page 19: Second Recirculation ballot cover letter
Page 20-25: Second Recirculation ballot results
Page 26: PAR Approval Letter
Page 27-28: PAR
Page 29: Copyright Release
Page 30: SCC10 Coordination Memo
Page 31: Editorial Coordination Memo
Page 32-33: SCC14 Coordination Comments and Responses

The draft itself (P802.16.2-REVa/D8) will be included separately in PDF format and supplied to the IEEE Staff Project Editor in FrameMaker format.

Please feel free to contact me with any questions or concerns.

Sincerely,

Roger B. Marks

**IEEE-SA STANDARDS BOARD
FORM FOR SUBMITTAL OF PROPOSED STANDARDS**

1. PROJECT NUMBER: P802.16.2-REVa

2. DATE: 19 Nov 2003

3. TITLE: Draft IEEE Recommended Practice for Local and Metropolitan Area Networks - Coexistence of Fixed Broadband Wireless Access Systems

4. SPONSOR (Full name of society/committee): Computer Society/LMSC + Microwave Theory & Techniques Society

5. BALLOTING COMMITTEE: 802.16 Working Group + Microwave Theory and Techniques Society

6. NAME OF WORKING GROUP: 802.16 Working Group on Broadband Wireless Access

7. NAME AND ADDRESS OF SUBMITTER

Roger B. Marks
NIST
325 Broadway, MC 813.00
Boulder, CO 80305
USA

Telephone: +1 303 497 3037

Fax: +1 303 497 3122

E-Mail: r.b.marks@ieee.org

8. DESCRIPTION OF DOCUMENT (Check one from each column.)

- | | | |
|--|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> New | <input type="checkbox"/> Standard | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Full Use (5-year life cycle) |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Revision | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Recommended Practice | <input type="checkbox"/> Trial Use (2-year life cycle) |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Reaffirmation | <input type="checkbox"/> Guide | |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Withdrawal | <input type="checkbox"/> Amendment/Corrigenda to an existing standard (Indicate number and year) _____ | |

8A. REAFFIRMATION ONLY:

The Sponsor confirms that the balloting group agrees that this standard continues to be useful in its current form and contains no significant obsolete or erroneous information.

- Yes No
-

9. BALLOT INFORMATION

List the interest categories of **eligible** balloters only. Refer to the IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual and the Working Guide for Submittal of Proposed Standards for the rules of balloting committee classification.

User Interest Category	15 No.	Producer Interest Category	13 No.	General Interest Interest Category	26 No.	Government Interest Category	2 No.
------------------------	--------	----------------------------	--------	------------------------------------	--------	------------------------------	-------

SUMMARY OF ELIGIBLE BALLOTS

	INITIAL BALLOT		RECIRCULATION BALLOT (if applicable)	
	Draft D6 Number	Date Closed: 2003-09-09 Percentage	Draft D8 Number	Date Closed: 2003-11-13 Percentage
Ballots Mailed	56	100%	56	100%
Ballots Returned	48	85	49	87
Affirmatives	44	97	47	100
Negatives	01	N/A	00	N/A
Abstentions	03	6	02	4
Reasons for abstentions:	Lack of time = 2		Lack of expertise = 0	
			Other = 0	

10. RESOLUTION OF COMMENTS AND NEGATIVE VOTES

All balloting group members, observers, and coordinating groups have been advised of substantive changes made with respect to the balloted draft standard (in response to comments, in resolving negative votes, or for other reasons) and have received copies of all unresolved negative votes with reasons from the negative voter and the rebuttal, and have been advised that they have an opportunity to change their votes.

- A. Have unresolved comments accompanying negative votes been circulated? *Include unresolved negative comments and rebuttal.* Yes No No unresolved comments
- B. Have substantive document changes been circulated? Yes No No substantive changes

11. COORDINATION ACTIVITY (Not required for reaffirmation)

Using the abbreviations listed below, indicate the response received from each committee/organization required for coordination and include a copy of the response. Include documentation authorizing coordination by common membership, if applicable.

R = Received R/C = Received with comment NR = Not received

Committee/Organization	Response	Committee/Organization	Response
SCC10 (IEEE Dictionary)	R		
SCC14 (Quantities, Units, & Letter Symbols)	R/C		
IEEE Standards Editorial Staff	R		

Indicate below any unresolved problems from coordination activities.

None. SCC10 comments were addressed and recirculated, without further comment.

12. PATENT/COPYRIGHT and REGISTRATION ISSUES

- A. Is there any patented material in the proposed standard? Yes No Originally indicated on the PAR, but not included in the final document
If yes, include letters(s) of assurance from the patent holder.
- B. Is there any copyrighted material in the proposed standard? Yes No
If yes, include copyright release(s).
- C. Is the registration of objects and/or numbers a provision of the proposed standard? If yes, include a proposal for review by the IEEE-SA Registration Authority Committee (RAC). Yes No Already approved by RAC

13. INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS ACTIVITIES (Not required for reaffirmation)

Is this document intended to be the basis of or included in an international standard? Yes (Explain) No

14. UNIT OF MEASUREMENT (check one)

- International System of Units (SI) - Metric Inch/Pound Both Not measurement sensitive
 Other _____
- Note: All SI, except some antenna sizes are stated in terms of feet.**

15. Source Materials Submitted to IEEE Standards Department

- A. Have electronic versions of the source documents (text and figures) been provided? Yes No Format: FrameMaker
- B. Will a diskette or other online material be required to accompany the published standard? Yes No

16. Submission checklist (X = included in submittal package N/A = Not applicable)

	Submission Package Item	List URL if online
X	This submittal form	http://iee802.org/16/docs/03/80216-03_56.pdf
X	Ballot summary form(s) (1 per ballot cycle)	http://iee802.org/16/docs/03/80216-03_56.pdf
N/A	Copies of unresolved negatives & rebuttals	http://iee802.org/16/private/drafts/tg2/P802162-REVa_D8.zip
X	PAR and PAR approval letter	http://iee802.org/16/docs/03/80216-03_56.pdf
X	Coordination comments and responses	http://iee802.org/16/docs/03/80216-03_56.pdf
X	.pdf of final balloted draft #D8	http://iee802.org/16/private/drafts/tgc/P80216_Conf02_D4.zip
X	Permissions & copyright releases	http://iee802.org/16/docs/03/80216-03_56.pdf
N/A	Delegation of balloting authority	

PROJECT NUMBER: P802.16.2-REVa

DATE: 2003-11-19

This draft standard has been developed in accordance with the policies and procedures of the Sponsor and I am authorized by those policies and procedures to make this submittal.



Chair, IEEE 802.16 Working Group

Signature of Submitter

Title (role in Sponsor)

FOR STANDARDS DEPARTMENT USE ONLY

Signature of IEEE-SA Officer

IEEE-SA Standards Board Chair

Title

Date

Return to:

IEEE Standards Department
RevCom Secretary
445 Hoes Lane
PO Box 1331
Piscataway, NJ 08855-1331

Ballot Summary

P802.16.2
Closing date: 2003-09-09

1. This ballot has met the 75% returned ballot requirement.

56 eligible people in this ballot group.

44 affirmative votes
1 negative votes with comments
0 negative votes without comments
3 abstention votes

=====

48 votes received = 85% returned
6% abstention

2. The 75% affirmation requirement is being met.

44 affirmative votes
1 negative votes with comments

=====

45 votes = 97% affirmative

Ballot Details

Coordination Responses Only

IEEE/Coord Number	Name	Role	Phone / E-mail	Coordination Ballot Received	Coordination Comment(s) Received
00601054	Bruce Barrow	SCC14		yes	yes
00001001	Editorial Coordinator	Editorial		-	-
00001000	SCC10 Coordinator	SCC10		yes	-

Balloters

Number	Name	Phone / E-mail	Vote	T	E	Graphics	Status Notes	Interest Category
05421045	John Adams		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
05587654	John Barr		-	-	-	-		Producer
41549239	Richard Burley		-	-	-	-		User
01454685	Edward Carley Jr		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		User
41437562	Remi Chayer		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
40327708	Aik Chindapol		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest

40237493	Keith Chow		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-			General Interest
03210820	Todor Cooklev		Approve, comments (Y1)	-	1	-			Government
06503270	Jose M. Costa		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-			Producer
41498366	Robert Crutchfield		-	-	-	-			User
40199311	Thomas Dineen		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-			Producer
08972887	Dr. Sourav Dutta		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-			General Interest
08518995	Avraham Freedman		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-			General Interest
41441328	Ernesto Garcia		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-			User
41348507	Theodore Georgantas		Abstain for lack of time (A1)	-	-	-			Producer
41414896	Andrew Germano		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-			General Interest
01883768	James Gilb		Disapprove, comments (N)	1	-	1			User

05995253	Brian Kiernan		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
41304605	Pi-Cheng Law		Abstain for lack of time (A1)	-	-	-		User
08108896	Yeou-Song Lee		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		User
03062650	Jan-Ray Liao		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
40255444	Christina Lim		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
01622778	Randolph Little		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
05845615	Gregory Luri		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		User
41273459	Ryan Madron		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
41265401	Nikolai Malykh		-	-	-	-		User
08122103	Roger B. Marks		Approve, comments (Y1)	-	-	-	Approve, comments without comment	Government
40266634	Ingolf Meier		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		Producer
01271899	George Miao		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest

40232349	Narayanan Murugesan		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
07446628	Michael Newman		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		User
07858459	Paul Nikolich		Abstain for lack of time (A1)	-	-	-		General Interest
02439719	Stephen Palm		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
41458692	Ashley Peacock		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		User
00353235	Subbu Ponnuswamy		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
01453273	Vikram Punj		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		Producer
40266494	Eugene Robinson		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
40318291	Thomas Sapiano		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
41497319	John Sarallo		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		Producer
40283080	John Sargent		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
40156964	Neil Shipp		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest

01109156	Gil Shultz		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
41545744	Yoram Solomon		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		Producer
41392686	Kenneth Stanwood		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		Producer
41523364	Adrian Stephens		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		Producer
40224483	Carl Stevenson		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		Producer
41315013	Mark Tillinghast		-	-	-	-		Producer
40110110	Scott Valcourt		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
03239332	Joan Viaplana		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
41278416	Hung-yu Wei		-	-	-	-		General Interest
04702171	Patrick Yu		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		Producer
05907266	Oren Yuen		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		User
40223729	apurva mody		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		User

41454280	charles ngethe		-	-	-		User		
41249250	Nico van Waes		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-		General Interest		
41522788	Karl weber		-	-	-		User		
Comment Totals *							1	1	1
(*) You have at least these many comments: each unstructured binary file (i.e., Word) is counted as a single G file, which may consist of one or hundreds of individual T and E comments.									

Summary of Eligible Voters by Interest Category

Interest Category	Affirmative(s)	Negative(s) with Comments	Negative(s) without Comments	Abstention(s)	Not Returned	Total
User	8	1	0	1	5	15
Producer	10	0	0	1	2	13
General Interest	24	0	0	1	1	26
Government	2	0	0	0	0	2
Voting Tally	44	1	0	3	8	56

Abstention details:	3 for lack of time (A1)	0 for lack of expertise (A2)	0 for other reasons (A3)
----------------------------	-------------------------	------------------------------	--------------------------

IEEE 802.16 Working Group on Broadband Wireless Access

<http://WirelessMAN.org>



Dr. Roger B. Marks
325 Broadway, MC 813.00
Boulder, CO 80305 USA
Tel: +1 303 497 3037
<mailto:r.b.marks@ieee.org>
30 September 2003

Dear P1802.16.2-REVa Balloting Group:

I am writing regarding the recirculation ballot for P1802.16.2-REVa. Please note that the original ballot group was formed under the designation P802.16.2, whereas the ballot was conducted as IEEE P802.16.2a. Without changing the original nature of the draft (as a draft revision of IEEE Std 802.16.2-2001), the designation has now changed to P1802.16.2-REVa based on a decision of the IEEE-SA Standards Board of 11 September 2003.

Thank you for your participation in the Sponsor Ballot, which closed on 9 September 2003. The results are, in summary: 43 Approve, 1 Disapprove, 3 Abstain, and 8 Not Voting. By virtue of these numbers, the ballot is considered to have passed, pending recirculation of comments and changes.

I particularly wish to thank those balloters who diligently studied the draft and provided comments. We were fortunate to receive a number of insightful comments. In addition to comments submitted directly in this ballot, we have also considered an additional set of comments that, though submitted to a different IEEE-SA ballot, were clearly intended to apply to the draft under ballot here. In total, we considered 111 comments. Resolutions were developed by a Ballot Resolution Committee appointed by the IEEE 802.16 Working Group on Broadband Wireless Access. The committee, chaired by Phil Whitehead, included Reza Arefi, Remi Chayer, Jack Garrison, Barry Lewis, and Roger Marks.

We are requesting that the IEEE Balloting Center initiate a fifteen-day recirculation of the comment resolutions (see file **80216-03_43r2.pdf**) and of the resulting new draft P802.16.2-REa/D7 (file **P802162-REVa_D7.pdf**). Should you prefer the database version of the resolutions for use with the program *Commentary*, it is available at http://ieee802.org/16/docs/03/80216-03_43r2.zip. We have included in the package all 111 comments, including those from the Approve voters as well as from the single Disapprove voter, James Gilb.

Please take this opportunity to review the package. You are not obligated to reply; if you do not, your current vote will stand. Based on the changes to the draft or on the Disapprove comments and responses, you may change your vote and/or submit additional comments. If you wish to re-vote or comment, please keep the deadline in mind. Instructions have been provided by the IEEE Balloting Center.

Sincerely,

Roger Marks
Chair, IEEE 802.16 Working Group on Broadband Wireless Access

Ballot Summary

P802.16.2-REVa/D7 Recirculation
 Closing date: 2003-10-16

This is a recirculation ballot. The report collates the results from the following groups: 0000566 0000642.

1. This ballot has met the 75% returned ballot requirement.

56 eligible people in this ballot group.

```

46 affirmative votes
0 negative votes with comments
0 negative votes without comments
3 abstention votes
=====
49 votes received = 87% returned
                    6% abstention
    
```

2. The 75% affirmation requirement is being met.

```

46 affirmative votes
0 negative votes with comments
=====
46 votes = 100% affirmative
    
```

Ballot Details

Coordination Responses Only

IEEE/Coord Number	Name	Role	Phone / E-mail	Coordination Ballot Received	Coordination Comment(s) Received
00601054	Bruce Barrow	SCC14		yes*	yes
00001001	Editorial Coordinator	Editorial		yes*	yes
00001000	SCC10 Coordinator	SCC10		yes*	yes

Balloters

Number	Name	Phone / E-mail	Vote	T	E	Graphics	Status Notes	Interest Category
05421045	John Adams		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
05587654	John Barr		-	-	-	-		Producer
41549239	Richard Burley		-	-	-	-		User
01454685	Edward Carley Jr		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		User
41437562	Remi Chayer		Approve, no comments (Y)*	-	-	-		General Interest
40327708	Aik Chindapol		Approve, no	-	-	-		General Interest

			comments (Y)					
40237493	Keith Chow		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
03210820	Todor Cooklev		Approve, comments (Y1)	-	1	-		Government
06503270	Jose M. Costa		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		Producer
41498366	Robert Crutchfield		-	-	-	-		User
40199311	Thomas Dineen		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		Producer
08972887	Dr. Sourav Dutta		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
08518995	Avraham Freedman		Approve, no comments (Y)*	-	-	-		General Interest
41441328	Ernesto Garcia		Approve, no comments (Y)*	-	-	-		User
41348507	Theodore Georgantas		Abstain for lack of time (A1)	-	-	-		Producer
41414896	Andrew Germano		Approve, no comments (Y)*	-	-	-		General Interest
01883768	James Gilb		Approve, comments (Y1)*	1	1	2		User

05995253	Brian Kiernan		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
41304605	Pi-Cheng Law		Abstain for lack of time (A1)	-	-	-		User
08108896	Yeou-Song Lee		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		User
03062650	Jan-Ray Liao		Approve, no comments (Y)*	-	-	-		General Interest
40255444	Christina Lim		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
01622778	Randolph Little		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
05845615	Gregory Luri		Approve, no comments (Y)*	-	-	-		User
41273459	Ryan Madron		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
41265401	Nikolai Malykh		-	-	-	-		User
08122103	Roger B. Marks		Approve, comments (Y1)	1	-	1		Government
40266634	Ingolf Meier		Approve, no comments (Y)*	-	-	-		Producer
01271899	George Miao		Approve, no comments (Y)*	-	-	-		General Interest
40232349	Narayanan Murugesan		Approve, no	-	-	-		General Interest

			comments (Y)					
07446628	Michael Newman		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		User
07858459	Paul Nikolich		Abstain for lack of time (A1)	-	-	-		General Interest
02439719	Stephen Palm		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
41458692	Ashley Peacock		Approve, no comments (Y)*	-	-	-		User
00353235	Subbu Ponnuswamy		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
01453273	Vikram Punj		Approve, no comments (Y)*	-	-	-		Producer
40266494	Eugene Robinson		Approve, no comments (Y)*	-	-	-		General Interest
40318291	Thomas Sapiano		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
41497319	John Sarallo		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		Producer
40283080	John Sargent		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
40156964	Neil Shipp		Approve, no comments (Y)*	-	-	-		General Interest
01109156	Gil Shultz		Approve, no	-	-	-		General Interest

			comments (Y)*					
41545744	Yoram Solomon		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		Producer
41392686	Kenneth Stanwood		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		Producer
41523364	Adrian Stephens		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		Producer
40224483	Carl Stevenson		Approve, no comments (Y)*	-	-	-		Producer
41315013	Mark Tillinghast		-	-	-	-		Producer
40110110	Scott Valcourt		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
03239332	Joan Viaplana		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
41278416	Hung-yu Wei		Approve, no comments (Y)*	-	-	-		General Interest
04702171	Patrick Yu		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		Producer
05907266	Oren Yuen		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		User
40223729	apurva mody		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		User
41454280	charles ngethe		-	-	-	-		User

41249250	Nico van Waes		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-	General Interest
41522788	Karl weber		-	-	-		User
Comment Totals *				2	2	3	
<p>(*) You have at least these many comments: each unstructured binary file (i.e., Word) is counted as a single G file, which may consist of one or hundreds of individual T and E comments.</p> <p>* This ballot cast this ballot in the current circulation of this recirc ballot.</p>							

Summary of Eligible Voters by Interest Category

Interest Category	Affirmative(s)	Negative(s) with Comments	Negative(s) without Comments	Abstention(s)	Not Returned	Total
User	9	0	0	1	5	15
Producer	10	0	0	1	2	13
General Interest	25	0	0	1	0	26
Government	2	0	0	0	0	2
Voting Tally	46	0	0	3	7	56

Abstention details:	3 for lack of time (A1)	0 for lack of expertise (A2)	0 for other reasons (A3)
----------------------------	-------------------------	------------------------------	--------------------------

IEEE 802.16 Working Group on Broadband Wireless Access

<http://WirelessMAN.org>



Dr. Roger B. Marks
325 Broadway, MC 813.00
Boulder, CO 80305 USA
Tel: +1 303 497 3037
<mailto:r.b.marks@ieee.org>
27 October 2003

Dear P1802.16.2-REVa Balloting Group:

Thank you for your participation in the P1802.16.2-REVa Sponsor Ballot. Following the first ballot recirculation, which ran from 1 through 16 October 2003, the results are, in summary: 46 Approve and 0 Disapprove.

We did receive twelve comments. As a result, a few substantive changes were made by the Ballot Resolution Committee appointed by the IEEE 802.16 Working Group on Broadband Wireless Access. The committee, chaired by Phil Whitehead, included Reza Arefi, Remi Chayer, Jack Garrison, Barry Lewis, and Roger Marks.

We are requesting that the IEEE Balloting Center initiate a recirculation of the comment resolutions (see file **80216-03_43r3.pdf**) and of the resulting new draft P802.16.2-REVa/D8 (file **P802162-REVa_D8.pdf**). Should you prefer the database version of the resolutions for use with the program *Commentary*, it is available at http://ieee802.org/16/docs/03/80216-03_43r3.zip. We have included in the package all 12 comments.

Please take this opportunity to review the package. You are not obligated to reply; if you do not, your current vote will stand. Based on the changes to the draft or on the Disapprove comments and responses, you may change your vote and/or submit additional comments. If you wish to re-vote or comment, please keep the deadline in mind. Instructions have been provided by the IEEE Balloting Center.

Sincerely,

Roger Marks
Chair, IEEE 802.16 Working Group on Broadband Wireless Access

Ballot Summary

P802.16.2-REVa/D8 2nd Recirculation
 Closing date: 2003-11-13

This is a recirculation ballot. The report collates the results from the following groups: 0000566 0000642 0000672.

1. This ballot has met the 75% returned ballot requirement.

56 eligible people in this ballot group.

47 affirmative votes
 0 negative votes with comments
 0 negative votes without comments
 2 abstention votes

=====

49 votes received = 87% returned
 4% abstention

2. The 75% affirmation requirement is being met.

47 affirmative votes
 0 negative votes with comments

=====

47 votes = 100% affirmative

Ballot Details

Coordination Responses Only

IEEE/Coord Number	Name	Role	Phone / E-mail	Coordination Ballot Received	Coordination Comment(s) Received
00601054	Bruce Barrow	SCC14		yes	yes
00001001	Editorial Coordinator	Editorial		yes*	yes
00001000	SCC10 Coordinator	SCC10		yes*	yes

Balloters

Number	Name	Phone / E-mail	Vote	T	E	Graphics	Status Notes	Interest Category
05421045	John Adams		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
05587654	John Barr		-	-	-	-		Producer
41549239	Richard Burley		-	-	-	-		User
01454685	Edward Carley Jr		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		User
41437562	Remi Chayer		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
40327708	Aik Chindapol		Approve, no	-	-	-		General Interest

			comments (Y)					
40237493	Keith Chow		Approve, no comments (Y)*	-	-	-		General Interest
03210820	Todor Cooklev		Approve, comments (Y1)	-	1	-		Government
06503270	Jose M. Costa		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		Producer
41498366	Robert Crutchfield		-	-	-	-		User
40199311	Thomas Dineen		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		Producer
08972887	Dr. Sourav Dutta		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
08518995	Avraham Freedman		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
41441328	Ernesto Garcia		Approve, no comments (Y)*	-	-	-		User
41348507	Theodore Georgantas		Abstain for lack of time (A1)	-	-	-		Producer
41414896	Andrew Germano		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
01883768	James Gilb		Approve, comments (Y1)	1	1	2		User

05995253	Brian Kiernan		Approve, no comments (Y)*	-	-	-		General Interest
41304605	Pi-Cheng Law		Approve, no comments (Y)*	-	-	-		User
08108896	Yeou-Song Lee		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		User
03062650	Jan-Ray Liao		Approve, no comments (Y)*	-	-	-		General Interest
40255444	Christina Lim		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
01622778	Randolph Little		Approve, no comments (Y)*	-	-	-		General Interest
05845615	Gregory Luri		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		User
41273459	Ryan Madron		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
41265401	Nikolai Malykh		-	-	-	-		User
08122103	Roger B. Marks		Approve, comments (Y1)	1	-	1		Government
40266634	Ingolf Meier		Approve, no comments (Y)*	-	-	-		Producer
01271899	George Miao		Approve, no comments (Y)*	-	-	-		General Interest
40232349	Narayanan Murugesan		Approve, no	-	-	-		General Interest

			comments (Y)*					
07446628	Michael Newman		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		User
07858459	Paul Nikolich		Abstain for lack of time (A1)	-	-	-		General Interest
02439719	Stephen Palm		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
41458692	Ashley Peacock		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		User
00353235	Subbu Ponnuswamy		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
01453273	Vikram Punj		Approve, no comments (Y)*	-	-	-		Producer
40266494	Eugene Robinson		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
40318291	Thomas Sapiano		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
41497319	John Sarallo		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		Producer
40283080	John Sargent		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
40156964	Neil Shipp		Approve, no comments (Y)*	-	-	-		General Interest
01109156	Gil Shultz		Approve, no	-	-	-		General Interest

			comments (Y)*					
41545744	Yoram Solomon		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		Producer
41392686	Kenneth Stanwood		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		Producer
41523364	Adrian Stephens		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		Producer
40224483	Carl Stevenson		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		Producer
41315013	Mark Tillinghast		-	-	-	-		Producer
40110110	Scott Valcourt		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
03239332	Joan Viaplana		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
41278416	Hung-yu Wei		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		General Interest
04702171	Patrick Yu		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		Producer
05907266	Oren Yuen		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		User
40223729	apurva mody		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-		User
41454280	charles ngethe		-	-	-	-		User

41249250	Nico van Waes		Approve, no comments (Y)	-	-	-	General Interest
41522788	Karl weber		-	-	-		User
Comment Totals *				2	2	3	
<p>(*) You have at least these many comments: each unstructured binary file (i.e., Word) is counted as a single G file, which may consist of one or hundreds of individual T and E comments.</p> <p>* This ballot cast this ballot in the current circulation of this recirc ballot.</p>							

Summary of Eligible Voters by Interest Category

Interest Category	Affirmative(s)	Negative(s) with Comments	Negative(s) without Comments	Abstention(s)	Not Returned	Total
User	10	0	0	0	5	15
Producer	10	0	0	1	2	13
General Interest	25	0	0	1	0	26
Government	2	0	0	0	0	2
Voting Tally	47	0	0	2	7	56

Abstention details:	2 for lack of time (A1)	0 for lack of expertise (A2)	0 for other reasons (A3)
----------------------------	-------------------------	------------------------------	--------------------------

[Email This Letter](#)

12 September 2003

Paul Nikolich
18 Bishops Lane
Lynnfield, MA 01940
paul.nikolich@att.net

Re: P802.16.2-REVa - Local and Metropolitan Area Networks - Recommended Practice for Coexistence of Fixed Broadband Wireless Access Systems

Dear Paul:

I am pleased to inform you that on 11 September 2003 the IEEE-SA Standards Board approved the above referenced project until 31 December 2005. A copy of the file can be found on our website at <http://standards.ieee.org/board/nes/projects/.pdf>.

Now that your project has been approved, please forward a roster of participants involved in the development of this project. This request is in accordance with the IEEE-SA Operations Manual, Clause 5.1.2f under Duties of the Sponsor which states:

"Submit annually to the IEEE Standards Department an electronic roster of individuals participating on standards projects"

For your convenience, an Excel spreadsheet for your use has been posted on our website at <http://standards.ieee.org/guides/par/roster.xls>. Please forward this list to me via e-mail at j.haasz@ieee.org no later than 9 December 2003.

Please visit our website, IEEE Standards Development Online (<http://standards.ieee.org/resources/development/index.html>), for tools, forms and training to assist you in the standards development process. Also, we strongly recommend that a copy of your draft be sent to this office for review prior to the final vote by the working group to allow for a quick review by editorial staff before sponsor balloting begins.

If you should have any further questions, please contact me at 732-562-6367 or by email at j.haasz@ieee.org.

Sincerely,

Jodi Haasz
Program Manager
International Stds Programs and Governance
Standards Activities
Phone +1 732 562 6367
FAX +1 208 460 5300
Email: j.haasz@ieee.org

cc: r.b.marks@ieee.org

PAR FORM

PAR Status: Revision of Revision PAR
PAR Approval Date: 2003-09-11
PAR Signature Page on File: Yes
Review of Standards Development Process: No

1. Assigned Project Number: 802.16.2-REVa

2. Sponsor Date of Request: 2003-06-20

3. Type of Document: Recommended Practice for

4. Title of Document:

Draft: Local and Metropolitan Area Networks - Recommended Practice for Coexistence of Fixed Broadband Wireless Access Systems

5. Life Cycle: Full Use

6. Type of Project:

6a. Is this an update to an existing PAR? Yes

If Yes: Indicated PAR number/approval date: P802.16.2a-08/17/2001

If Yes: Is this Project in Ballot now? No

6b. The Project is a: Revision of Std 802.16.2-2001

7. Contact Information of Working Group:

Name of Working Group: IEEE 802.16 Working Group on Broadband Wireless Access

Name of Working Group Chair: Roger B Marks

Telephone: 303-497-3037 **FAX:** 509-756-2642

Email: r.b.marks@ieee.org

8. Contact Information of Official Reporter (If different than Working Group Chair)

Name of Official Reporter: (if different than WG contact)

Telephone: **FAX:**

Email:

9. Contact Information of Sponsoring Society or Standards Coordinating Committee:

Name of Sponsoring Society and Committee: Computer Society Local and Metropolitan Area Networks/Microwave Theory & Tech.

Name of Sponsoring Committee Chair: Paul Nikolich

Telephone: 857-205-0050 **FAX:** 781-334-2255

Email: paul.nikolich@att.net

Name of Liaison Rep. (If different than Sponsor Chair):

Telephone: **FAX:**

Email:

10. The Type of ballot is: Individual Sponsor Ballot

Expected Date of Submission for Initial Sponsor Ballot: 2003-08-01

11. Fill in Projected Completion Date for Submittal to RevCom: 2003-10-21

Explanation for Revised PAR that Completion date is being extended past the original four-year life of the PAR:

12. Scope of Proposed Project:

This project revises IEEE Std 802.16.2-2001. In particular, it specifies extensions and modifications addressing two distinct topics. The first is coexistence between multipoint systems and point-to-point systems in the frequency range 10-66 GHz. The second is coexistence among fixed broadband wireless access systems operating in licensed bands within the frequency range 2-11 GHz. Updates to the existing content will also be considered.

13. Purpose of Proposed Project:

The purpose of this Revision is to provide additional coexistence guidelines to license holders, service providers, deployment groups, and system integrators. The specifications will facilitate the deployment and operation of fixed broadband wireless access systems while minimizing the need for case-by-case coordination.

14. Intellectual Property:

Sponsor has reviewed the IEEE patent policy with the working group? Yes

Sponsor is aware of copyrights relevant to this project? No

Sponsor is aware of trademarks relevant to this project? No

Sponsor is aware of possible registration of objects or numbers due to this project? No

15. Are there other documents or projects with a similar scope? No

Similar Scope Project Information:

16. Is there potential for this document (in part or in whole) to be submitted to an international organization for review/adoption? Do not Know

If yes, please answer the following questions:

Which International Organization/Committee?

**International Contact
Information?**

17. If the project will result in any health, safety, or environmental guidance that affects or applies to human health or safety, please explain, in five sentences or less. No

18. Additional Explanatory Notes: (Item Number and Explanation)



Sophia Antipolis, 10 June 2003

Dr. Roger B. Marks
NIST
325 Broadway, MC 813.00
Boulder, CO 80303
USA

Our ref.: LC/2003-015/STR/mtc

Subject: Copyright authorization from ETSI to Dr. Roger B. Marks

Dear Sir,

In response to the recent Mr. Whitehead's request (IEEE 802.16 task group 2 chair), and in corrigendum of our previous authorization (our ref L/2001-106/STR/mtc), please be informed that the ETSI Standard EN 301-390 V1.1.1, is protected by copyright and is the property of the European Telecommunications Standards Institute (ETSI).

By the present letter, ETSI is pleased to grant IEEE (Working Group 802.16.2.2001) the right to reproduce figures 2 & 3 (both relating to spurious emission limits falling in the frequency range 21,2 GHz to 43,5 GHz) from the ETSI Standard EN 301-390 V1.1.1, in the IEEE Standard 802.16.2-2001 "IEEE Recommended Practice for Local and metropolitan area networks. Coexistence of Fixed Broadband Wireless Access Systems", provided that you insert the following paragraph, when citing:

"© ETSI 2000. Further use, modification, redistribution is strictly prohibited. ETSI standards are available from publication@etsi.fr, and <http://www.etsi.org/cds/eds.htm>."

This copyright authorization allows for reproduction only in printed and computer materials of the above-cited standard, on a regional scale and for an unlimited period of time.

Should the above information fall under patent protection, this copyright authorisation is not to be construed as an authorisation to use and/or implement patent information without fulfilling any attached obligations.

Yours sincerely,

P.P.

Karl Heinz Rosenbrock
Director-General

MEMO

TO: Balloting Center
FROM: Savoula Amanatidis
DATE: 7 November 2003
RE: SCC10 Coordination of P802.16.2-REVa/D8

I have reviewed Clause 3 Definitions of P802.16.2-REVa/D8 and it meets all the requirements for SCC 10 Coordination.

Sincerely,

Savoula Amanatidis
Managing Editor, IEEE Standards Activities

Voice: +1 732 562 3831
s.amanatidis@ieee.org

Fax: +1 732 562 1571

Email:

MEMO

TO: Balloting Center
FROM: Savoula Amanatidis
DATE: 7 November 2003
RE: Editorial Coordination of P802.16.2-REVa/D8

I have reviewed P802.16.2-REVa/D8 and it meets all the requirements for Editorial Coordination.

Sincerely,

Savoula Amanatidis
Managing Editor, IEEE Standards Activities

Voice: +1 732 562 3831
s.amanatidis@ieee.org

Fax: +1 732 562 1571

Email:

Document under Review: **P802.16.2a/D6**Ballot Number: **0000566**

Comment Date

Comment # **001**

Comment submitted by: Bruce

Barrow

Other

2003/09/09

Comment	Type	Coordination	Starting Page #	Starting Line #	Fig/Table#	Section
The symbol dBi is used throughout to indicate antenna gain above isotropic. This seems unnecessary and adds yet another confusing dB symbol.						

Suggested Remedy

Express antenna gain in dB. If clarification is thought to be essential, include "antenna gain" among the definitions.

Proposed Resolution **Recommendation: Accepted-Modified** **Recommendation by** Roger Marks

Insert a more specific definition of dBi, drawn from a standard reference. See Comment 019 for details.

Reason for Recommendation

The removal of the "i" from "dBi" could lead to ambiguity and should therefore be retained. The symbol dBi was not invented here; it is, in fact, universally recognized. It is used in documents of the International Telecommunications Union, the U.S. Federal Communications Commission, NASA, ETSI, etc. The definition to be added (see Comment 019) is identical to that of ANS T1.523-2001 (Telecom Glossary 2000) and U.S. Federal Standard 1037C-1996.

Resolution of Group**Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified**

Insert a more specific definition of dBi, drawn from a standard reference. See Comment 019 for details

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

The removal of the "i" from "dBi" could lead to ambiguity and should therefore be retained. The symbol dBi was not invented here; it is, in fact, universally recognized. It is used in documents of the International Telecommunications Union, the U.S. Federal Communications Commission, NASA, ETSI, etc. The definition to be added (see Comment 019) is identical to that of ANS T1.523-2001 (Telecom Glossary 2000) and U.S. Federal Standard 1037C-1996

Group's Notes**Group's Action Items**

Editor's Notes **Editor's Actions** l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns**Editor's Action Items**

Document under Review: **P802.16.2a/D7**Ballot Number: **0000642**

Comment Date

Comment # **114**

Comment submitted by: Bruce

Barrow

Other

2003-10-09

Comment	Type	Coordination	Starting Page #	Starting Line #	Fig/Table#	Section
---------	------	--------------	-----------------	-----------------	------------	---------

SCC14 Comments on P802.16.2-REVa/D7

LAN/MAN Networks – Coexistence of Fixed Broadband Wireless Access Systems

September 9, 2003

Table 3, p. 31 – The column heading "(W/m²/MHz)" is incorrect. The notation a/b/c is not defined in algebra. Please substitute "[W/m²]/MHz".

7.2.5, p. 74 – In two places W/m² should be W/m².

Bruce B. Barrow
Chair, SCC14

Suggested Remedy

Proposed Resolution

Recommendation: **Accepted**Recommendation by [Roger Marks](#)

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: **Accepted-Clarified**

(1) Table 3, p. 31 – Replace column heading "psfd dB(W/m²/MHz)" to "psfd dB[W/m²]/MHz".

(2) 7.2.5, p. 74, line 18 & 19 – Replace

"...coordination trigger values of -125 dB(W/m²) in any 1 MHz for 3.5 GHz and -126 dB(W/m²) in any 1 MHz..." with
"...coordination trigger values of -125 dB[W/m²]/MHz in any 1 MHz for 3.5 GHz and -126 dB[W/m²]/MHz in any 1 MHz..."

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

(1) Make the expression correct.

(2) Correct an editorial mistake.

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions [k\) done](#)

Editor's Questions and Concerns