



Project	IEEE 802.16 Broadband Wireless Access Working Group < http://ieee802.org/16 >	
Title	IEEE 802.16 Working Group Confirmation Ballot #14d Announcement	
Date Submitted	2004-09-18 21	
Source(s)	Roger Marks NIST 325 Broadway Boulder, CO 80305	Voice: +1-303-497-3037 mailto:r.b.marks@ieee.org
Re:	IEEE 802.16-04/51r3 and IEEE P802.16e/D5	
Abstract	This document announces and details the procedure for IEEE 802.16 Confirmation Ballot #14d, the fourth recirculation of IEEE 802.16 Working Group Letter Ballot #14.	
Purpose	To document the process of Confirmation Ballot #14d.	
Notice	This document has been prepared to assist IEEE 802.16. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.	
Release	The contributor grants a free, irrevocable license to the IEEE to incorporate material contained in this contribution, and any modifications thereof, in the creation of an IEEE Standards publication; to copyright in the IEEE's name any IEEE Standards publication even though it may include portions of this contribution; and at the IEEE's sole discretion to permit others to reproduce in whole or in part the resulting IEEE Standards publication. The contributor also acknowledges and accepts that this contribution may be made public by IEEE 802.16.	
Patent Policy and Procedures	The contributor is familiar with the IEEE 802.16 Patent Policy and Procedures < http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/policy.html >, including the statement "IEEE standards may include the known use of patent(s), including patent applications, provided the IEEE receives assurance from the patent holder or applicant with respect to patents essential for compliance with both mandatory and optional portions of the standard." Early disclosure to the Working Group of patent information that might be relevant to the standard is essential to reduce the possibility for delays in the development process and increase the likelihood that the draft publication will be approved for publication. Please notify the Chair < mailto:chair@wirelessman.org > as early as possible, in written or electronic form, if patented technology (or technology under patent application) might be incorporated into a draft standard being developed within the IEEE 802.16 Working Group. The Chair will disclose this notification via the IEEE 802.16 web site < http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/notices >.	

IEEE 802.16 Working Group Confirmation Ballot #14d Announcement

1. Introduction

This announcement opens IEEE 802.16's Confirmation Ballot #14d, the fourth recirculation of IEEE 802.16 Working Group Letter Ballot #14.

On the question: *To accept the resolutions of comments from Working Group Recirculation Ballot #14c, as recorded in the comment database IEEE 802.16-04/51r3:*

http://iee802.org/16/docs/04/80216-04_51r3.zip

and to forward, for IEEE 802 LMSC Sponsor Ballot, IEEE P802.16e/D5:

http://iee802.org/16/private/drafts/tge/P80216e_D5.zip

Document title: *“Draft Amendment to IEEE Standard for Local and Metropolitan Area Networks — Part 16: Air Interface for Fixed and Mobile Broadband Wireless Access Systems — Amendment for Physical and Medium Access Control Layers for Combined Fixed and Mobile Operation in Licensed Bands ”*

Ballot opening date: **18 September 2004**

Ballot closing date: **3 October 2004** AOE (“Anywhere on Earth”)

2. Procedure

2.1 Results of Prior Ballot Rounds

The **Results of Letter Ballot #14 (including Recircs #14a, #14b, and #14c)** are available at

<http://iee802.org/16/tge/ballot14/report14.html>.

The ballot was approved (45**47** Approve, ~~3~~**1** Disapprove, 8 Abstain [~~93.8~~**97.9**% approval]), pending recirculation of Disapprove comments and changes to resolve comments.

2.2 Previous Votes Carried Forward

If you do not cast a ballot in this recirculation but cast a previous ballot in Working Group Letter Ballot #14 or a recirculation of it, your previous vote will be carried forward.

2.3 No Obligation of Working Group Members to Participate in Ballot

Working Group Members are not obliged to participate in this ballot, nor in any recirculation ballot. Participation or lack of participation will not affect Working Group Membership.

2.4 Scope of Ballot

The scope of the recirculation ballot includes only the disposition of the unresolved Disapprove (“Technical, Binding”) comments and the changes to the draft as documented in the comment resolutions under review (along with the implementation of those resolutions in the draft). For the unresolved Disapprove comments, see Annex B.

2.5 To read the comment database

To read the comment database, you must open it using the standalone program *Commentary* (version 1.5 or higher). For instructions, see 2.8.

2.6 To submit a ballot

To submit a ballot, use the form at:

<http://ieee802.org/16/tge/ballot14/ballotform14d.html>

2.7 Disapprove Votes

Disapprove votes must include specific “Technical, Binding” comments on what must be done to the comment resolutions to change the vote to “Approve”.

If you are on record as a Disapprove voter following the previous ballot round, please submit a ballot in which you either vote Approve or in which you specify, in a comment, which of your previous Binding comments may be marked “Satisfied”.

The three Disapprove voters, along with their unsatisfied “Technical, Binding” comments, are provided in Annex B.

2.8 To submit a ballot with comments or to submit comments only

If you wish to submit a ballot with comments (with or without a vote), you must download the standalone program *Commentary* (version 1.5 or higher) and use it to prepare your vote and comments. Submission instructions are included. *Commentary* is available at:

<http://ieee802.org/16/docs/Commentary>

Comments *must* be submitted following the procedure defined in the ballot form at <<http://ieee802.org/16/tge/ballot14/ballotform14d.html>>.

2.9 To confirm receipt of your ballot and check the ballot status report

To confirm receipt of your ballot, see the ballot status report at:

<<http://ieee802.org/16/tge/ballot14/report14.html>>.

3. Working Group Letter Ballot Process

IEEE 802 rules specify that “the decision to submit a draft standard or a revised standard to the Sponsor Ballot Group must be ratified by a letter ballot.” The following motion was passed (by vote of 51 Approve/ 0 Disapprove/ 1 Abstain) at the Closing Plenary of IEEE 802.16’s Session #33:

- “To accept IEEE 802.16-04/51r2 as the resolutions of WG Recirc Ballot #14c comments, develop DraftP802.16e/D5 based on those resolutions, initiate Confirmation Ballot, and request conditional approval from the IEEE 802 LMSC to proceed to Sponsor Ballot, closing that ballot before Session #34, if possible”

3.1 Criteria for Approval

3.1.1 50% Return Rate

The required 50% return rate was met in Letter Ballot #14. There is no return rate requirement for a recirculation ballot.

3.1.2 75% Approval Rate

The ballot will not be considered successful unless approved by at least 75% of the ballot group members voting “Approve” or “Disapprove”.

3.1.3 Comment Resolution

The Working Group shall attempt to resolve all in-scope comments collected in the ballot process. All substantive technical changes, and all unresolved negative votes, together with the reasons of the negative voter and the rebuttal by the members conducting the resolution of the ballots, shall be subject to a recirculation ballot of at least fifteen days.

3.1.4 Failed Ballots

Should the approval rate be less than 75%, the Working Group shall nevertheless proceed with comment resolution and then offer “Disapprove” voters the opportunity to change their vote to “Approve”. Should this process result in a 75% or higher approval rate, the approval criterion in 3.1.2 shall be considered met.

Should this process fail to achieve the 75% approval rate, a new draft shall be prepared in accordance with the comment resolutions. A new Working Group Letter Ballot of the resulting draft shall be initiated by vote of the Working Group or at the discretion of the Working Group Chair.

3.2 Draft Availability

Following IEEE guidelines, the document under review is considered a Draft Standard. IEEE requires that Draft Standards carry the IEEE copyright notice and be restricted in distribution. As a result, the document has been posted on the IEEE 802.16 password-protected web site. Members and Observers shall not share the password. Other interested parties should see the URL:

<http://iee802.org/16/published.html>

and contact the Chair <<mailto:r.b.marks@ieee.org>> with any questions.

3.3 Ballot Group

The Ballot Group for Confirmation Ballot #14d is provided in Annex A. It includes the individuals who were Members of IEEE 802.16 as of the start of Letter Ballot #14. Except to remedy errors in the this membership list, the Ballot Group will not change through the course of Letter Ballot #14, including its resulting recirculation ballots, even as the Working Group membership changes.

3.4 Participation by Individuals outside the Ballot Group

Individuals who are not Ballot Group members are not invited to submit comments in this Confirmation Ballot.

3.5 Public Release of Individual Ballots

Detailed ballot results will be posted to the IEEE 802.16 Web Site.

4. Patent Policy and Procedures

Please take note of the IEEE 802.16 Patent Policy

<<http://iee802.org/16/ipr/patents/policy.html>>.

IEEE standards may include the known use of patent(s), including patent applications, provided the IEEE receives assurance from the patent holder or applicant with respect to patents essential for compliance with both mandatory and optional portions of the standard. Early disclosure to the Working Group of patent information that might be relevant to the standard is essential to reduce the possibility for delays in the development process and increase the likelihood that the draft publication will be approved for publication. Please notify the Chair <<mailto:chair@wireless-man.org>> as early as possible, in written or electronic form, if patented technology (or technol-

ogy under patent application) might be incorporated into a draft standard being developed within the IEEE 802.16 Working Group. The Chair will disclose this notification via the IEEE 802.16 web site <<http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/notices>>.

Annex A: Ballot Group for IEEE 802.16 Working Group Letter Ballot #14

Aditya Agrawal	Baraa Al-Dabagh	Gordon Antonello
Reza Arefi	Eli Avivi	Phillip Barber
David Castelow	Dean Chang	Naftali Chayat
Rémi Chayer	Stephen Dick	Brian Eidson
Carl Eklund	Roger Eline	Marc Engels
Avraham Freedman	G. Jack Garrison	Marianna Goldhammer
Zion Hadad	David Hartman	David Johnston
Panyuh Joo	Tal Kaitz	Ofer Kelman
Brian Kiernan	Itzik Kitroser	Changhoi Koo
Jonathan Labs	Yigal Leiba	Donald Leimer
Barry Lewis	Lingjie Li	John Liebetreu
Hyoungsoo Lim	Lars Lindh	Hui-Ling Lou
Heinz Lycklama	Roger Marks	Russell McKown
Andrew Middleton	Ronald Murias	Robert Nelson
Greg Phillips	Kamlesh Rath	Gene Robinson
Randall Schwartz	Yossi Segal	Radu Selea
James Simkins	Kenneth Stanwood	Carl Stevenson
Yoshihiro Suzuki	Shawn Taylor	David Trinkwon
Rainer Ullmann	Nico van Waes	Eyal Verbin
Arthur Wang	Lei Wang	Stanley Wang
Philip Whitehead	Vladimir Yanover	Choong-il Yeh
Chulsik Yoon		

Annex B: Disapprove Voters and Comments after Recirculation Ballot #14c

Voter	Outstanding Disapprove (“Technical Binding”) Comments
Eklund, Carl	006*
Kaitz, Tal	433*, 501*, 503*
Nelson, Robert	580 ⁺ , 672 ⁺ , 734 ⁺ , 763 ⁺ , 10083*, 10258*, 121*, 133*, 139*

*This comment was previously recirculated at least once; see IEEE 802.16-04/38r4:

<http://iee802.org/16/docs/04/80216-04_38r4.zip>

⁺These comments are being recirculated for the first time. They are in the database under review.

~~and~~ All six unresolved Disapprove comments are also available in a separate PDF file:

<http://iee802.org/16/docs/04/80216-04_63r1.pdf>