

[Proposed] 802.20 PAR Response

Document Number:

IEEE C802.16-04/22

Date Submitted:

Thursday, July 15, 2003

Source:

David Johnston

Individual Contributor

E-mail: david.johnston@ieee.org

Venue:

IEEE 802.16 Plenary Meeting in Portland, OR

Purpose:

Describe rationale and provide motion text for directing the chair to make a request to withdraw the 802.20 PAR

Notice:

This document has been prepared to assist IEEE 802.16. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.

Release:

The contributor grants a free, irrevocable license to the IEEE to incorporate material contained in this contribution, and any modifications thereof, in the creation of an IEEE Standards publication; to copyright in the IEEE's name any IEEE Standards publication even though it may include portions of this contribution; and at the IEEE's sole discretion to permit others to reproduce in whole or in part the resulting IEEE Standards publication. The contributor also acknowledges and accepts that this contribution may be made public by IEEE 802.16.

IEEE 802.16 Patent Policy:

The contributor is familiar with the IEEE 802.16 Patent Policy and Procedures <<http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/policy.html>>, including the statement "IEEE standards may include the known use of patent(s), including patent applications, provided the IEEE receives assurance from the patent holder or applicant with respect to patents essential for compliance with both mandatory and optional portions of the standard." Early disclosure to the Working Group of patent information that might be relevant to the standard is essential to reduce the possibility for delays in the development process and increase the likelihood that the draft publication will be approved for publication. Please notify the Chair <<mailto:chair@wirelessman.org>> as early as possible, in written or electronic form, if patented technology (or technology under patent application) might be incorporated into a draft standard being developed within the IEEE 802.16 Working Group. The Chair will disclose this notification via the IEEE 802.16 web site <<http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/notices>>.

802.20 PAR Response

David Johnston

david.johnston@ieee.org

Proposal

- At the end of this presentation, I intend to make a motion directing the chair to make a motion in the closing EC plenary meeting, to withdraw the PAR of 802.20
- To support this, the following slides describe the rational for this position
- I also intend to make a motion seeking the approval of this rational by the 802.16 WG

Recent Actions by 802.20

- 802.20 has voted unanimously to direct the chair to vote no on the 802.16e PAR change request
- 802.20 has voted unanimously to direct the chair to vote no on the 802.16g PAR request
- These PARs represent substantial work by 802.16e and the NetMan Study Group to reach a consensus position on how to structure our work. The 802.20 actions seek to halt this work in its tracks
- The rationales for this have been comprehensively rebutted by 802.16.
- These actions are consistent with a pattern of behavior in 802.20 that is detrimental the smooth running and effective progression of the 802 standards groups and standards.
- It is these actions and the history of 802.20 behavior that has precipitated the need for to 802.16 to take action to protect its ability to write consensus based standards in a timely fashion in the future.

A Lack of Consensus

- 802.20 has to date not managed to achieve a consensus on any aspect of a standard, nor even a requirements document
- Consensus has not been reached on leadership. This has to date been decided on close margins
- This is despite the group meeting regularly since September 2002

Technical Progress

- 802.16 has published a number of metropolitan area network standards, including the recent revision IEEE std 802.16-2004 and is in a letter ballot cycle on 802.16e, a major work item.
- At the time of writing, 802.20 has, after 9 meetings approved no standard, no draft nor any requirements document. In addition it does not appear that any such document is likely to be approved on a consensus basis in the near future.
- We note that the expected date of submission for the 802.20 standard to sponsor ballot is May 2004 (2 months ago).

Expectation for a Standard

- Based on the current rate of progress against plan in 802.20 and the failure of the participants to work towards a consensus position on technical matters, we can have no expectation that 802.20 will publish a standard in the foreseeable future.

External Focus

- At the same time that 802.20 has failed to work towards consensus based technical solutions, they have devoted considerable effort towards external matters including
 - Liaison with non IEEE groups
 - Reviewing and rejecting the PARs of other groups
- This is not an appropriate use of their time when the group is chartered to write a standard

Distinct Identity

- 802.20 has sought to carve out a distinct identity based on the details of FFT sizes, channel bandwidths, frequency bands, spectral efficiencies and other technical minutiae.
- These technical minutiae may serve to define a distinct identity where the groups involved can co-exist and try to compete on technical merit
- However the fact is that the 802.20 PAR describes a mobile broadband MAN, overlapping with non fixed modes of 802.16e, for a mobile broadband MAN.
- We observe no attempt to co-exist peacefully with 802.16. Instead we note that the only consensus position in 802.20 is to try to block the 802.16 PARs.
- We also observe that while 802.20 has a PAR, the scope of that PAR is not available to other groups with a track record in publishing standards.

Voting Controversy

- The officer elections in 802.20 have led directly to:
 - Accusations of voting irregularities
 - The denial of office to elected officers for extended periods of time
 - Appeals to the IEEE SA
 - The withdrawal of members of the EC from EC meetings to avoid risk of legal retribution
 - The consumption of much time and effort on the part of the EC and the participants in the elections
- Other, more effective groups manage to conduct fair and open elections and abide by the results.

Conclusions Regarding 802.20

- We conclude that the 802.20 WG is not a body that can produce an approved standard in a timely fashion on a consensual basis.
- We also conclude that 802.20 has had a deleterious effect on the output of the 802.16 working group, through its rejection of PARs essential to the development of the 802.16 standard, the unwillingness to participate in a resolution process on the PARs and the consequent workload involved in responding to such unwarranted rejections.
- We also conclude that the scope of the 802.20 PAR should be freed for other more effective working groups to occupy so that they are able to produce a timely standard within it.

Motions

- Direct the 802.16 Chair to bring the following motion in the closing EC plenary meeting
 - Move to withdraw the 802.20 PAR
- Approve the contents of document C802.16-04/22 as the rational for the previous motion and request that the 802.16 chair forwards the C802.16-04/22 document to the EC.