



Project	<b>IEEE 802.16 Broadband Wireless Access Working Group</b> < <a href="http://ieee802.org/16">http://ieee802.org/16</a> >	
Title	<b>IEEE 802.16 Working Group Letter Ballot Recirc#18c Announcement</b>	
Date Submitted	<b>2005-10-25</b>	
Source(s)	Roger Marks NIST 325 Broadway Boulder, CO 80305	Voice: +1-303-497-7837  <a href="mailto:r.b.marks@ieee.org">mailto:r.b.marks@ieee.org</a>
Re:	IEEE 802.16 WG Letter Ballot Recirculation #18c, on comments leading to P802.16/Conformance04/D4	
Abstract	This document announces and details the procedure for IEEE 802.16 Letter Ballot Recirc #18c, the third recirculation of IEEE 802.16 Working Group Letter Ballot #18.	
Purpose	To document the process of Letter Ballot Recirc #18c.	
Notice	This document has been prepared to assist IEEE 802.16. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.	
Release	The contributor grants a free, irrevocable license to the IEEE to incorporate material contained in this contribution, and any modifications thereof, in the creation of an IEEE Standards publication; to copyright in the IEEE's name any IEEE Standards publication even though it may include portions of this contribution; and at the IEEE's sole discretion to permit others to reproduce in whole or in part the resulting IEEE Standards publication. The contributor also acknowledges and accepts that this contribution may be made public by IEEE 802.16.	
Patent Policy and Procedures	The contributor is familiar with the IEEE 802.16 Patent Policy and Procedures < <a href="http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/policy.html">http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/policy.html</a> >, including the statement "IEEE standards may include the known use of patent(s), including patent applications, provided the IEEE receives assurance from the patent holder or applicant with respect to patents essential for compliance with both mandatory and optional portions of the standard." Early disclosure to the Working Group of patent information that might be relevant to the standard is essential to reduce the possibility for delays in the development process and increase the likelihood that the draft publication will be approved for publication. Please notify the Chair < <a href="mailto:chair@wirelessman.org">mailto:chair@wirelessman.org</a> > as early as possible, in written or electronic form, if patented technology (or technology under patent application) might be incorporated into a draft standard being developed within the IEEE 802.16 Working Group. The Chair will disclose this notification via the IEEE 802.16 web site < <a href="http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/notices">http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/notices</a> >.	

# IEEE 802.16 Working Group Letter Ballot Recirc #18c Announcement

## 1. Introduction

This announcement opens IEEE 802.16's Letter Ballot Recirc #18c.

*On the question: To accept the resolutions of comments from Working Group Letter Ballot #18b, as recorded in IEEE 802.16-05/075r2:*

[http://ieee802.org/16/docs/05/80216-05\\_075r2.zip](http://ieee802.org/16/docs/05/80216-05_075r2.zip)

*and to forward, to the IEEE 802 LMSC Executive Committee for Sponsor Ballot, IEEE P802.16/Conformance04/D4:*

[http://ieee802.org/16/pubs/P80216\\_Conf04.html](http://ieee802.org/16/pubs/P80216_Conf04.html)

**Document title:** “*Draft Standard for Conformance to IEEE 802.16 - Part 4: Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement (PICS) Proforma for Frequencies below 11 GHz*”

Ballot opening date: **25 October 2005**

Ballot closing date: **9 November 2005 AOE** <http://ieee802.org/16/aoe.html>

## 2. Procedure

### 2.1 Results of Prior Ballot Rounds

The **Results of Letter Ballot #18** (including recirculations) are available at

<http://ieee802.org/16/tgc/C4/ballot18/report18.html>.

The ballot results stand at 142 Approve, 54 Disapprove, 17 Abstain), pending recirculation of changes to resolve the comments. The current approval ratio is below the 75% minimum required for approval.

All comments received, along with the resolutions developed by the IEEE 802.16 Working Group, are available in IEEE 802.16-05/075r2:

[http://ieee802.org/16/docs/05/80216-05\\_075r2.zip](http://ieee802.org/16/docs/05/80216-05_075r2.zip)

## 2.2 Previous Votes Carried Forward

If you do not cast a ballot in this recirculation but cast a previous ballot in Working Group Letter Ballot #18 or a recirculation of it, your previous vote will be carried forward.

## 2.3 No Obligation of Working Group Members to Participate in Ballot

Working Group Members are not obliged to participate in this ballot, nor in any recirculation ballot. Participation or lack of participation will not affect Working Group Membership.

## 2.4 Scope of Ballot

The scope of the recirculation ballot includes only the disposition of the outstanding Disapprove (“Technical, Binding”) comments and the changes to the draft as documented in the comment resolutions under review (along with the implementation of those resolutions in the draft). The only comment resolutions under review are those in IEEE 802.16-05/075r2.

## 2.5 To submit a ballot

To submit a ballot, use the form at:

<http://dot16.org/ballot18/ballotform18c.html>

## 2.6 Disapprove Votes

Disapprove votes must include specific “Technical, Binding” comments on what must be done to the comment resolutions to change the vote to “Approve”.

If you are on record as a Disapprove voter following the previous ballot round, please submit a ballot in which you either vote Approve or in which you specify, in a comment, which of your previous Binding comments may be marked “Satisfied”.

## 2.7 To submit a ballot with comments or to submit comments only

If you wish to submit a ballot with comments (with or without a vote), you must download the standalone program *Commentary* (version 1.5 or higher) and use it to prepare your vote and comments. Submission instructions are included. *Commentary* is available at:

<http://ieee802.org/16/docs/Commentary>

Comments *must* be submitted following the procedure defined in the ballot form:

<<http://dot16.org/ballot18/ballotform18c.html>>.

## **2.8 To confirm receipt of your ballot and check the ballot status report**

To confirm receipt of your ballot, see the ballot status report at:

<<http://ieee802.org/16/tgc/C4/ballot18/report18.html>>.

## **3. Working Group Letter Ballot Process**

IEEE 802 rules specify that “the decision to submit a draft standard or a revised standard to the Sponsor Ballot Group must be ratified by a letter ballot.”

### **3.1 Criteria for Approval**

#### **3.1.1 50% Return Rate**

The required 50% return rate was met in Letter Ballot #18. There is no return rate requirement for a recirculation ballot.

#### **3.1.2 75% Approval Rate**

The ballot will not be considered successful unless approved by at least 75% of the ballot group members voting “Approve” or “Disapprove”.

#### **3.1.3 Comment Resolution**

The Working Group shall attempt to resolve all in-scope comments collected in the ballot process. All substantive technical changes, and all unresolved negative votes, together with the reasons of the negative voter and the rebuttal by the members conducting the resolution of the ballots, shall be subject to a recirculation ballot of at least fifteen days.

#### **3.1.4 Failed Ballots**

Should the approval rate be less than 75%, the Working Group shall nevertheless proceed with comment resolution and then offer “Disapprove” voters the opportunity to change their vote to “Approve”. Should this process result in a 75% or higher approval rate, the approval criterion in 3.1.2 shall be considered met.

Should this process fail to achieve the 75% approval rate, a new draft shall be prepared in accordance with the comment resolutions. A new Working Group Letter Ballot of the resulting draft, or an additional recirculation, shall be initiated by vote of the Working Group or at the discretion of the Working Group Chair.

### **3.2 Ballot Group**

The Ballot Group for Recirculation Ballot #18c is provided in Annex A. It includes the individuals who were Members of IEEE 802.16 as of the start of Letter Ballot #18. Except to remedy

errors in the this membership list, the Ballot Group will not change through the course of Letter Ballot #18, including its resulting recirculation ballots, even as the Working Group membership changes.

### 3.3 Participation by Individuals outside the Ballot Group

Individuals who are not Ballot Group members are welcome to submit ballot comments.

### 3.4 Public Release of Individual Ballots

Detailed ballot results will be posted to the IEEE 802.16 Web Site.

## 4. Patent Policy and Procedures

Please take note of the Patent Policy

<http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/policy.html>.

## Annex A: Ballot Group for IEEE 802.16 Working Group Letter Ballot #18

Abrishami, Ray	Agis, Edward	Agrawal, Aditya	Al-Dabagh, Baraa
Alamouti, Siavash	Aliotta, Mario	Amitabha, Ghosh	Andelman, Dov
Antonello, Gordon	Athalye, Sanjeev	Avivi, Eli	Ayyr, Ravi
Baek, Sung Kwan	Banerjea, Raja	Barber, Phillip	Baum, Kevin
Bentov, Izhar	Bhalla, Rajesh	Blankenship, Yufei	Bogenfeld, Eckard
Brooks, Terri	Brown, Thomas	Cai, Sean	Carlo, Jim
Castelow, David	Cavalli, Giulio	Cha, Jaesun	Chae, Chan-Byoung
Chan, John	Chang, Dean	Chang, Jae Hwan	Chang, Sungcheol
Chang, Yong	Chao, Jim	Chauvin, Todd	Chayat, Naftali
Chayer, Rémi	Chen, Jennifer	Chen, Tao	Chen, Yuehua (Lucy)
Chindapol, Aik	Chion, Hua (Mary)	Cho, Jaehee	Cho, Jaeweon
Cho, Kihyoung	Cho, Seokheon	Choi, Hyoung-Jin	Chou, Joey
Chun, Jin Young	Chung, Jin Yong	Chung, Kyuhyuk	Costa, José
Cote, Guy	Cudak, Mark	Dang, Meimei	Dang, Shujun
Demarty, Joël	Dennett, Steve	Diaine, Pascale	Dondeti, Lakshminath
Dong, Xiaolu	Draper, Frank	Eastwood, Lester	Eklund, Carl
Eliaspur, Yigal	Eline, Roger	Elkayam, Oren	Etemad, Kamran
Exeler, Frank	Fahldieck, Torsten	Fan, Shijun (James)	Fang, Yonggang

Feder, Peretz	Feng, Dazi	Fong, Mo-Han	Franovici, Bogdan
Freedman, Avraham	Geipel, Mike	Giesberts, Pieter-Paul	Goel, Nikhil
Goldhamer, Mariana	Golshan, Reza	Guo, Jin	Guo, Qiang
Hadad, Zion	Hahn, Yung	Han, Jun	Hansen, Chris
Harrang, Jeff	Haskin, John	He, Haixiang	He, Peng
Hsiao, Chang-Lung	Huang, Haiming	Huang, Peter	Huang, Zhaoyun (Laura)
Hui, Benjamin	Humbert, John	Hur, Yerang	Hwang, Ho-Tark
Hwang, InSeok	Hwang, Seung Ku	Ibbetson, Luke	Ihm, Bin-Chul
Iyer, Prakash	Jain, Avinash	Jang, Jiho	Jeon, Jaeho
Jeong, Moo Ryong	Jin, Yong Seok	Johnson, Brian	Johnston, David
Joo, Panyuh	Kaitz, Tal	Kalavakunta, Ravi	Kang, Hyunjeong
Kang, Samuel	Kelly, Ivy	Kelman, Ofer	Kerr, Adam
Kiernan, Brian	Kim, Beomjoon	Kim, Bong Ho	Kim, Byoung-Jo
Kim, Chong-kwon	Kim, Dae-Joong	Kim, Jaehyeong	Kim, Jaeyoel
Kim, JaeYoung	Kim, Jeong-Heon	Kim, Jeonghwi	Kim, Min Sung
Kim, Ronny (Yong-Ho)	Kim, Yong Bum	Kim, Youngho	Kim, YoungKyun
Kitroser, Itzik	Knudsen, Chris	Koh, Kang Il	Koo, Changhoi
Koorapaty, Havish	Kotecha, Lalit	Krishnasamy, Denesh	Kurosawa, Yoko
Kuze, Toshiyuki	Kwon, Dongseung	LaBrecque, Margaret	Labs, Jonathan
Lai, Ming-Yee	Lamoureux, Jules Pierre	Lee, Chang-jae	Lee, Chi-Chen
Lee, Jae Hak	Lee, Seong Choon	Lee, Sungjin	Leiba, Yigal
Lewis, Barry	Li, Dina	Li, Jia-Ru	Li, Jiang
Li, Jun	Li, Kemin	Li, Wei	Li, Xiaodong
Li, Yongmao	Lim, Geunhwi	Lim, Hyoung Kyu	Lim, Hyoungsoo
Lim, Sun Ju	Lindskog, Erik	Lo, Titus	Lou, Hui-Ling
Lycklama, Heinz	Lynch, Michael	Lyon, Daniel	Lysejko, Martin
Ma, Steve	Maeng, Seung Joo	Maez, David	Mandin, Jeffrey
Mankin, Kevin	Marks, Roger	McGinniss, David	Migaldi, Scott
Mo, Xiu	Mollenauer, James	Mont-Reynaud, Ollivier	Moon, Dong-II (Stephan)
Muenzner, Roland	Murakami, Fumio	Murias, Ronald	Nakamura, Kenichi
Nam, Seung Hoon	Natarajan, K.S.	Nguyen, Nha	Nitsche, Gunnar
Odlyzko, Paul	Oh, Min Seok	Olfat, Masoud	Or, Alan
Ovadia, Shlomo	Park, Joonho	Park, Pyung-Su	Park, Young Man
Park, Youngsoo	Patel, Vijay	Pearman, Trevor	Pechner, Dave

Petti, Bonnie	Phillips, Greg	Piggin, Paul	Poisson, Sebastien
Popper, Ambroise	Priebe, Russell	Puthenkulam, Jose	Rath, Kamlesh
Reid, Anthony	Reifsnider, Eric	Retnasothie, Francis	Reudink, Douglas
Reynolds, Russ	Riegel, Maximilian	Rogers, Chris	Rogers, Shane
Roh, Wonil	Ruck, Herbert	Rush, Charles	Ryu, Byung-Han
Ryu, Kiseon	Sago, Andrew	Salvekar, Atul	Sanderson, Michael
Schumacher, Gregory	Schwartz, Randall	Seagren, Christian	Segal, Yossi
Selea, Radu	Shakouri, Mohammad	Shankaranarayanan, N.K.	Shasha, Eli
Simkins, James	Solomon, David	Son, Jung Je	Son, Yeong Moon
Stanwood, Kenneth	Stewart, Kenneth	Tang, Chunhui	Tani, Kazuki
Taylor, Shawn	Tcha, Yongjoo	Tong, Wen	Ullmann, Rainer
Vafai, Mano	Vasudevan, Subramanian	Verbin, Eyal	Vook, Frederick
Walma, Mathys	Wang, Arthur	Wang, Guo Qiang	Wang, Irving
Wang, Jing	Wang, Lei	Wang, Stanley	Watanabe, Yasuyuki
Wei, Xuefei	Wennstrom, Mattias	Weon, Dong-Jun	Wieczorek, Alfred
Wu, Geng	Wu, Jun	Wunsch, Janice	Yaghoobi, Hassan
Yang, Weidong	Yaniv, Ran	Yanover, Vladimir	Yeh, Choong-Il
Yeh, Sang-Kuk	Yeo, Kunmin	Yoon, Chulsik	Yoon, Soon Young
Yu, Chang Wahn	Yun, Jungnam	Zhang, Jianzhong	Zhang, Wenfeng
Zhang, Wenzhong	Zhu, Keqiang	Zhu, Peiying	