

2006-11-15

IEEE 802.16-06/074r1

To: Al Petrick, Vice-Chair, IEEE 802.11 Working Group
From: Roger Marks, Chair, IEEE 802.16 Working Group

Dear Al,

Thank you for your comments below. We found them creative and stimulating.

We appreciate your suggestions regarding the coordination of ITU-R advanced activities throughout IEEE 802. We fully support the notion and would be willing to aid and assist.

We do not fully understand the statement that “Currently 802.16 is the gateway to ITU.” We do believe that IEEE 802.16 has established a history of communications and interactions with ITU-R. Please note that all of our PARs, ever since the first 802.16 PAR in 1999, indicate that we intend our work for internationalization through ITU. We believe that this is unique in IEEE 802.

We disagree that 802.16 is a “gateway” to ITU-R, and we do not claim an exclusive relationship. To the contrary, we are happy to share our knowledge and experience to aid the other working groups on this issue. Please consider our tutorial of 13 November on IMT-Advanced as an example of this willingness.

Regarding your specific proposal to change the Scope, we do not believe it that it is appropriate for the Scope statement to discuss input from other groups or the creation of a TAG. Consider, in particular, that the Scope is intended for reproduction on the resulting standard. However, we have made other changes in the PAR and Five Criteria that we hope will address your concerns.

Note also that the output of the project would be a standard, not a direct contribution to ITU-R. We have made changes to try to sharpen the distinction. The PAR is to develop the standard. A goal is that it be suitable for contribution to ITU-R. That contribution would be strengthened by coordination with other IEEE 802 standards. Note, for instance, that ITU-T Rec. M.1645 specifically calls out a role for wireless LANs.

Regarding your comment that IEEE 802.16’s ITU-R Liaison is “in reality” the liaison “between the IEEE and ITU-R,” we disagree, noting that the position exists and is separately filled. That individual should be best suited to determining the legality of ITU document distribution, which you have suggested.

As a result of your comments, and others we have received, we have made clear and specific edits to the draft PAR and Five Criteria. We are submitting a revised PAR and Five Criteria and hope that you appreciate the improvements.

I would like to offer to participate in your WG’s Friday Closing Plenary to review the changes and answer any questions.

Regards,

Roger

To: Roger Marks 802.16 WG Chair

From: Al Petrick, 802.11 WG Vice-Chair

Date: 11/14/06

Subject: IEEE 802.11 WG Comments to PAR

The following are comments from the 802.11WG on the following Par:

PAR: P802.16m Advanced Air Interface

General Comments:

1. Currently 802.16 is the gateway to ITU. The IEEE 802 ExCom should organize a TAG that crosses 802 working boundaries to benefit all working groups, and include useful contributions from these groups, and include more than just an Air Interface.
2. Expanding the Role of IEEE 802.16 Liaison. In reality the liaison is between the IEEE and ITU-R. IEEE 802.16 should consider distribution of ITU-R documents for IMT Advanced requirements and evaluation criteria to other IEEE 802 working for consideration

Change the "Scope of Proposed Project" to include:

5.3 Scope of Proposed Standard:

The Scope of the project should include: 1) input from other interested IEEE 802 Working Groups and identify such groups in the definition of the scope or 2) Create an IEEE 802 level group (TAG) that would allow coordination from other IEEE 802 working groups.

Change the "Need for the Project" as follows:

5.5: Need for the Project: The International Telecommunications Union – Radiocommunications Sector (ITU-R), is preparing to develop the IMT-Advanced radio interface standards to provide advanced air interface specifications for mobile telecommunications. On the current schedule, initial proposals for IMT-Advanced are anticipated to be solicited for mid-2008, and standardization is expected to continue through 2009. This project will seek to develop an advanced IEEE 802.16 air interface by working cooperatively with ITU-R and its members and with other wireless IEEE 802 working groups.

Include "Coexistence Assurance":

Coexistence Assurance: Need to include co-existence assurance document as required by IEEE 802 Policies and Procedures ie Procedure 21.