

2008/08/21

IEEE 802.16-07/045r5

Comment by: robert popoli

Membership Status: Member

Date: ?

Comment # 0908

Document under Review: P802.16j/D1

Ballot ID: 28

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page 167 Line 28 Fig/Table# Subclause 8.4.4.7.2.3

Access channel utilizes frequency diversity to improve link performance. Same technique would also be valuable to improve link performance on the AMC subchannels. This feature should be added.

Suggested Remedy

Contribution C802.16j-07464 should be accepted into document to achieve added link performance.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

No objection

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2008/08/21

IEEE 802.16-07/045r5

Comment by: Zhibin Lin

Membership Status: Member

Date: 9/7/2007

Comment # 0780

Document under Review: P802.16j/D1

Ballot ID: 28

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page 133 Line 26 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.22.1.1

Because access RS can transmit MR_Generic-ACK message or ACK header , the MR-BS shall transmit MOB_SCN-RSP to the MS after it receives MR_Generic-ACK or ACK header from the access RS.

Suggested Remedy

Modify "the MR-BS shall transmit MOB_SCN-RSP to the MS after it receives MR_Generic-ACK from the access RS."
to"the MR-BS shall transmit MOB_SCN-RSP to the MS after it receives MR_Generic-ACK or ACK header from the access RS."

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

No objection

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2008/08/21

IEEE 802.16-07/045r5

Comment by: Lei Wang

Membership Status: Member

Date: 9/8/2007

Comment # 0205

Document under Review: P802.16j/D1

Ballot ID: 28

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page 18 Line 32 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.2.2.8.2

The subheaders are considered to be part of the payload, as illustrated in Figure 18 in published 802.16 specs, as well as in Figure 21a in this document. In particular, they may be encrypted.

Suggested Remedy

Change: The Allocation subheader shall be the last subheader ~~before the payload~~.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

No objection

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2008/08/21

IEEE 802.16-07/045r5

Comment by: Lei Wang

Membership Status: Member

Date: 9/8/2007

Comment # 0083

Document under Review: P802.16j/D1

Ballot ID: 28

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page 6 Line 49 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.1.3

MPDU is not defined in this document. Moreover, this term was replaced by MAC PDU in 802.16 specs at least 4 years ago. There is no reason to introduce it back again.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "MPDU" by "MAC PDU" throughout this document.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

No objection

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2008/08/21

IEEE 802.16-07/045r5

Comment by:

Erik Colban

Membership Status: Member

Date: ?

Comment # 0165

Document under Review: P802.16j/D1

Ballot ID: 28

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page 14 Line 14 Fig/Table# 19d Subclause 6.3.2.1.2.2.2.3
BS?!

Suggested Remedy

MR-BS

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

No objection

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

Comment by:

Erik Colban

Membership Status: MemberDate: ?Comment # 0791Document under Review: P802.16j/D1Ballot ID: 28

<u>Comment</u>	<u>Type</u>	<u>Technical</u>	<u>Part of Dis</u>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <u>Satisfied</u>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<u>Page</u>	<u>Line</u>	<u>Fig/Table#</u>	<u>Subclause</u>
	Technical		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>		136	48		6.3.22.4.1.2

IP address management is outside the scope of 802.16. It is unlikely that the IP addresses would need to be renewed. Under a typical scenario, Mobile IP would be used and the MS would be assigned an address from its home network, which does not change. This should be handled by another forum. 802.16 should simply provide the hooks.

Suggested Remedy

Change: An RS, when operating in moving BS mode, ~~the RS~~ shall implement a full set of physical layer and MAC layer functions defined in ~~IEEE802.16e-2005~~ excluding the convergence sublayer. The mobile RS is also the serving station of the MS. The mobile RS shall perform handover per 6.3.22.2. After the mobile RS hands over to a new target MR-BS, ~~if the mobile RS enters into a new IP subnet, the IP addresses of all the MSs served by this mobile RS may need to be re-established.~~ A dedicated transport connection may be established between the mobile RS and its serving MR-BS to relay the IP address re-establishment related higher layer signaling between the MS and the MR-BS that may have been triggered by the mobility event.

GroupResolution**Decision of Group:** Accepted**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution****Group's Notes**

No objection

Editor's Notes**Editor's Actions**

Comment by:

Paul Piggini

Membership Status: MemberDate: ?Comment # 0053Document under Review: P802.16j/D1Ballot ID: 28Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page 5 Line 11 Fig/Table# Subclause 3.100

Since a relay station has multiple interfaces, RTD is ambiguous.

Suggested Remedy

Clarify that the RTD is the round trip delay between the RS and a subordinate station, by adding the following sentence to the end of the definition:

RTD is the round trip delay between the RS and its superordinate station.

Group Resolution**Decision of Group: Accepted****Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

Note: comment #50 adopted a general definition for RTD. This comment clarifies its interpretation in terms of R-TTG.

Group's Notes

No objection

Editor's Notes**Editor's Actions**

Comment by: Yanhong Wang

Membership Status: Member

Date: 9/8/2007

Comment # 0822

Document under Review: P802.16j/D1

Ballot ID: 28

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page 143 Line 1 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.24

In subclause 6.3.24 (MS idle mode), there is the following description:

"FRS and NRS may have same or different Paging Groups compared to controlling MR-BS."

This is confusing. Does this mean that the FRS may be assigned a PG, which is out of scope of its controlling MR-BS? Clarification is needed here.

If FRS/NRS's paging group is different from that of the controlling MR-BS. The MR-BS will not received the paging announce message from PC. Therefore, the RS can not broadcast the paging message.

Suggested Remedy

Do the following changes:

"FRS and NRS may have same or just a subset of Paging Groups compared to their controlling MR-BS."

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

No objection

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

Comment by: Tzu-Ming Lin

Membership Status: Member

Date: 1/15/2008

Comment # 2036

Document under Review: P802.16j/D2

Ballot ID: LB28a

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page 5 Line 14 Fig/Table# Subclause 3.105

Doubled definitions of security zone key. (3.105 and 3.116)

Suggested Remedy

3.105 security zone key (SZK): A group key shared by the MR-BS and a group of RS within the same security zone. The SZK is a head of key hierarchy used to satisfy the security requirements, such as integrity protection for relay MAC PDUs within a defined security zone.

~~3.116 security zone key (SZK): The SZK is a head of key hierarchy used to satisfy the security requirements, such as integrity protection for relay MAC PDUs within a defined security zone.~~

[editor's note]

reorder the sequence number from 3.106 to 3.118

Group Resolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions a) done

2008/08/21

IEEE 802.16-08/002r3

Comment by: Shulan Feng

Membership Status: Member

Date: 1/14/2008

Comment # 2042

Document under Review: P802.16j/D2

Ballot ID: LB28a

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis Satisfied Page 5 Line 33 Fig/Table# Subclause 3

missing space between "A" and "portion".

Suggested Remedy

change"Aportion" to "A portion".

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions a) done

2008/08/21

Comment by:

Jerry Chow

Membership Status: Member

Date: 3/14/2008

Comment # **026**

Document under Review: **P802.16h/D3**

Ballot ID:

Comment

Type Technical

Part of Dis



Satisfied



Page 22

Line 4

Fig/Table#

Subclause

6.3.2.1.2.2.2.7

As indicated in 6.3.6.7.1.3, DL flow control mechanism is just used for RS operating in distributed scheduling mode.

Suggested Remedy

Change the sentence as following:

The DL flow control header is used to perform DL flow control between an RS operating in distributed scheduling mode and its superordinate RS or MR-BS.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2008/08/21

Comment by: Shulan Feng

Membership Status: Member

Date: 3/14/2008

Comment # **260**

Document under Review: **P802.16j/D3**

Ballot ID:

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis Satisfied Page 205 Line 19 Fig/Table# Subclause 8.4.5.10

Missing "." at the end of the sentence

Suggested Remedy

Modify the sentence as the following:

This message shall be used in non-transparent frame structure and may be used in transparent frame structure to signal the resource assignments and other control information.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2008/08/21

Comment by: Shulan Feng

Membership Status: Member

Date: 3/14/2008

Comment # **090**

Document under Review: **P802.16j/D3**

Ballot ID:

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis Satisfied Page 84 Line 44 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.6.7.1.2

This sentence is grammatically incorrect.

Suggested Remedy

Replace as the following:

the scheduling information needs only be sent once

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2008/08/21

Comment by: Hongyun Qu

Membership Status: Member

Date: 3/15/2008

Comment # 143

Document under Review: P802.16j/D3

Ballot ID:

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis Satisfied Page 122 Line 42 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.10.3.2.1

Figure 118c and Figure 118d are not used for ranging, instead, in P133, they are used for HARQ.

Suggested Remedy

Change the sentence into:

The flow charts (Figure 115a, Figure 115b, Figure 115c, Figure 115d, Figure 118a; [and](#) Figure 118b; ~~Figure 118c and Figure 118d~~) and message sequence chart (Table 206a and Table 206b) on the following pages define the CDMA periodic ranging and adjustment process that shall be followed by compliant SSs, transparent access RSs and MR-BSs.

Renumber "Figure 118c-Example of Initial transmission of HARQ burst" and "Figure 118d-Example of initial transmission and retransmission of HARQ burst" in P133, since they don't belong to ranging procedure.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2008/08/21

Comment by: Hongyun Qu

Membership Status: Member

Date: 3/15/2008

Comment # 131

Document under Review: P802.16j/D3

Ballot ID:

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page 107 Line 39 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.10.3.1.1

This paragraph describes one kind of ranging in centralized scheduling mode.

Suggested Remedy

Change this paragraph into:

When an SS performs initial ranging in systems with transparent RSs attached to non-transparent RSs that have unique BSIDs, the MR-BS, superordinate station (a non-transparent RS operating in centralized scheduling mode), and the transparent RSs shall perform the following steps:

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2008/08/21

Comment by: Hongyun Qu

Membership Status: Member

Date: 3/15/2008

Comment # **051**

Document under Review: **P802.16j/D3**

Ballot ID:

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page 59 Line 3 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.2.3.78

Since "RS_MOB_MEAS-RSP" message is used for MR-BS to request RSs in the RS group for reporting their measurement results. Why not call it "RS_MOB_MEAS-REQ"?

Suggested Remedy

Change all "RS_MOB_MEAS-RSP" into "RS_MOB_MEAS-REQ".

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2008/08/21

Comment by: Hongyun Qu

Membership Status: Member

Date: 3/15/2008

Comment # **287**

Document under Review: **P802.16j/D3**

Ballot ID:

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis Satisfied Page 240 Line 45 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.7.8.10

The font of sentence "An RS sets bit #7 to 0 to indicate that it cannot perform DL flow control and to 1 to indicate that it can perform DL flow control." is different with other paragraphs.

Suggested Remedy

Keep the font consistent.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2008/08/21

Comment by:

Ling Xu

Membership Status: Member

Date: 3/14/2008

Comment # 296

Document under Review: P802.16j/D3

Ballot ID:

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis Satisfied Page 264 Line 7 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.25.1

In current text, the RS operational mode includes tunneling burst mode, which is already delted in the last meeting.

Suggested Remedy

change the text as follows.

Bit #0:RS centralized scheduling

Bit #1:RS distributed scheduling

Bit #2:RS centralized security

Bit #3:RS distributed security

Bit #4:0 = shared BSID with other

access stations, 1 = unique BSID

Bit #5:Embedded path management

Bit #6:Explicit path management

Bit #7:Burst-based forwarding

Bit #8:Tunneling packet mode

~~Bit #9:Tunneling burst mode~~

Bit #~~10~~9:Local CID allocation mode

Bit #~~11~~10: Superordinate RS of an RS group

Bit #~~12~~11~15: reserved

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2008/08/21

Comment by: Ling Xu

Membership Status: Member

Date: 3/14/2008

Comment # 284

Document under Review: P802.16j/D3

Ballot ID:

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis Satisfied Page 240 Line 10 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.7.8.10

In current text, the MR-BS and RS MAC feature support includes tunnel burst mode, which is already delted in the last meeting.

Suggested Remedy

change the text as follows:

Bit #0: NBR-ADV generating support

Bit #1: Tunnel packet mode support

~~Bit #2: Tunnel burst mode support~~

~~Bit #2: Superordinate RS of an RS group support~~

Bit #3: RS mobility support

Bit #4: Subordinate RS network entry support

Bit #5: Location support

Bit #6: Multicast management support

Bit #7: DL Flow control

Bit #8: RS centralized security support

Bit #9: RS distributed security support

Bit #10: Embedded path management support

Bit #11: Explicit path management support

Bit #12: Burst-based forwarding support

Bit #13: Local CID allocation support

Bit #14: MOB_SLP-RSP support

Bit #15: MOB_SCN-RSP support

~~Bit #16: Superordinate RS of an RS group support~~

Bit #~~17_16~~-#23: Reserved

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2008/08/21

Comment by: Ling Xu

Membership Status: Member

Date: 3/14/2008

Comment # 297

Document under Review: P802.16j/D3

Ballot ID:

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis Satisfied Page 264 Line 7 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.25.1

Tunneling packet mode and Tunnel packet mode are both used in the 16j D3.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Tunneling packet mode" with "Tunnel packet mode"

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2008/08/21

Comment by: Ling Xu

Membership Status: Member

Date: 3/14/2008

Comment # 265

Document under Review: P802.16j/D3

Ballot ID:

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis Satisfied Page 217 Line Fig/Table# 496j Subclause 8.4.5.10.1.7

The "OFDMA symbol" should be "OFDMA symbol offset".

Suggested Remedy

Change "OFDMA symbol" as "OFDMA symbol offset".

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions