

Supporting report to EC for request of conditional approval to initiate sponsor ballot on P802.16j

IEEE 802.16 Presentation Submission Template (Rev. 9)

Document Number:

IEEE 802.16-08/039r1

Date Submitted:

2008-07-17

Source:

Mike Hart, Mitsuo Nohara, Jung Je Son, Peiying Zhu
UK Broadband, KDDI, Samsung, Nortel Networks

Voice:

E-mail: mike.hart@ukbroadband.com

Venue:

Session #56

Base Contribution:

None

Purpose:

Report to the EC on the status of LB28 in support of request for conditional approval to initiate sponsor ballot on the IEEE P802.16j draft.

Notice:

This document does not represent the agreed views of the IEEE 802.16 Working Group or any of its subgroups. It represents only the views of the participants listed in the "Source(s)" field above. It is offered as a basis for discussion. It is not binding on the contributor(s), who reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.

Release:

The contributor grants a free, irrevocable license to the IEEE to incorporate material contained in this contribution, and any modifications thereof, in the creation of an IEEE Standards publication; to copyright in the IEEE's name any IEEE Standards publication even though it may include portions of this contribution; and at the IEEE's sole discretion to permit others to reproduce in whole or in part the resulting IEEE Standards publication. The contributor also acknowledges and accepts that this contribution may be made public by IEEE 802.16.

Patent Policy:

The contributor is familiar with the IEEE-SA Patent Policy and Procedures:

<<http://standards.ieee.org/guides/bylaws/sect6-7.html#6>> and <<http://standards.ieee.org/guides/opman/sect6.html#6.3>>.

Further information is located at <<http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-material.html>> and <<http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat>>.

Rules

- Motions requesting conditional approval to forward where the prior ballot has closed shall be accompanied by:
 - Date the ballot closed
 - Vote tally including Approve, Disapprove and Abstain votes
 - Comments that support the remaining disapprove votes and Working Group responses.
 - Schedule for confirmation ballot and resolution meeting.

Date the Ballot Closed

7 July 2008

Stage	Open	Close
Letter Ballot 28	10 Aug 2007	9 Sept 2007
Letter Ballot Recirc 28a	24 Dec 2007	14 Jan 2008
Letter Ballot Recirc 28b	29 Feb 2008	15 Mar 2008
Letter Ballot Recirc 28c	25 Apr 2008	9 May 2008
Letter Ballot Recirc 28d	6 June 2008	7 July 2008

Vote tally including Approve, Disapprove and Abstain votes

- Approve: 287
- Disapprove: 4
 - only 1 with outstanding comments
 - The remaining 3 have no comments.
- Abstain: 22
- Return ratio: 89.4%
- Approve ratio: 98.6%
(Approve ratio: 99.7% [excluding Disapprove without Comments])

Comments that support the remaining disapprove votes and Working Group responses

- LB 28:
 - 1 outstanding comments, *comment was accepted verbatim*
- LB recirc 28a:
 - No outstanding comments
- LB recirc 28b:
 - No outstanding comments
- LB recirc 28c:
 - No outstanding comments
- LB recirc 28d:
 - 1 outstanding comment (received very late)

Comment #1 that support the remaining disapprove votes and Working Group responses

- Comment (No. **0908 in LB28**)

Access channel utilizes frequency diversity to improve link performance. Same technique would also be valuable to improve link performance on the AMC subchannels. This feature should be added.

- Remedy

Contribution C802.16j-07464 should be accepted into document to achieve added link performance.

- Resolution: *Accepted*

- Note: This comment submitted at the initial ballot, accepted, but no response received from the originator.

Comment #2 that support the remaining disapprove votes and Working Group responses

•Comment (No. [LL5188](#) in [LB28d](#))

The AAS mode description is properly documented in D5 with the inclusion of C802.16j-08/133, C802.16j-08/134, C802.16j-08/135 currently on the upload server. These contributions were held over from Macau, China to further accommodate the membership's review. These contributions directly address only the optional AAS mode and have no impact whatsoever on any other mode. With the acceptance of these contributions, I have no further reservation and can change my vote to approve.

•Remedy

Adopt c802.16j-08_133, c802.16j-08_134, c802.16j-08_135.

Resolution: Rejected

•Reasons:

- 1. The proposed scheme is incomplete.
- 2. The proposed private MAP message in contribution 133 is not consistent with the Table 453 in IEEE 802.16e baseline document.
- 3. Partition/Burst Control encode defined in Table 2 is not a proper message, it only defined the high level structure, need to format it into a proper message.
- 4. UL timing/frequency adjustment introduces a new ranging scheme, which needs to provide proper update in Section 6, where describes the ranging process.
- 5. Probe-preamble is not consistently defined, need to clarify

•Note: The comment submitted on July 16, while the ballot closed on July 7. The comment was considered and rejected. No other comment received from this disapprove voter.

Schedule for confirmation ballot and resolution meeting

- 22 July : Open WG confirmation ballot
- 6 Aug.: Close WG confirmation ballot
TG Chair and WG Chair to resolve any comments by 8 Aug.
- 15 Aug: Open sponsor ballot

Appendix: 802.16 WG Motions

1. To authorize the WG Chair to request EC's conditional approval to initiate Sponsor Ballot on P802.16j, closing that ballot before session #57, if possible.
 - Motion 1st: Mitsuo Nohara, 2nd: Ron Murias at 20:
 - Passed: 66/0/0
2. To authorize the WG Chair and Relay TG Chair to resolve comments received in Confirmation Ballot.
 - Motion 1st: Mitsuo Nohara, 2nd: Avner Aloush at 20:45
 - Passed: 64/0/1

Appendix: List of Disapprove Voters

- Cai, Sean (No comments)*
- Li, Thomas (No comments)
- Popoli, Robert (2 comments)
- Wu, Yingzhe (No comments)

*: expressed conversion to approve as recorded in meeting minutes.