

2008/08/05

IEEE 802.16-08/049r3 coord

Comment by: Michelle Turner

Membership Status: Member

Date: 4-Sep-2008

Comment # 6

Document under Review: P802.16Rev2/D6a

Ballot ID: 802.16Rev2R0

Comment Type General Part of Dis Satisfied Page 0 Line 0 Fig/Table# Subclause 0

Figures in IEEE standards are printed in black ink only. Please make sure the color that exists in your graphics is not needed to understand the graphic.

Suggested Remedy

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Agree

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions b) none needed

2008/08/05

IEEE 802.16-08/049r3

Comment by: Michelle Turner

Membership Status: Member

Date: 4-Sep-2008

Comment # 7

Document under Review: P802.16Rev2/D6a

Ballot ID: 802.16Rev2R0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page 0 Line 0 Fig/Table# Subclause 0

Have you secured permission to use data from other sources, including text, tables, or figures? Even if they were used in a previous edition, those permissions might need to be updated.

Suggested Remedy

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Principle

We have reviewed the permission from Cable Television Laboratories (see *l*) and see no reason to update the existing permission statements and we are not aware of any other materials for which permission is required.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions b) none needed

2008/08/05

IEEE 802.16-08/049r3 coord

Comment by: Michelle Turner

Membership Status: Member

Date: 4-Sep-2008

Comment # 8

Document under Review: P802.16Rev2/D6a

Ballot ID: 802.16Rev2R0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page 9 Line 0 Fig/Table# Subclause 2

I noticed that many of the IEEE references have years attached to them, most of them outdated. However, as the introductory paragraph of the standard explains, undated references are automatically updated to the most recent editions. Unless the references are only to be made to the older editions, please remove the years.

Suggested Remedy

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Principle

Remove the years from all IEEE references listed in Subclause 2.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions a) done

2008/08/05

IEEE 802.16-08/049r3 coord

Comment by: Michelle Turner

Membership Status: Member

Date: 4-Sep-2008

Comment # 9

Document under Review: P802.16Rev2/D6a

Ballot ID: 802.16Rev2R0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis Satisfied Page 0 Line 0 Fig/Table# Subclause 0

Please review the labeling of informative text within the standard. Currently, Table 3, 7.2.2.2.9.1.3, and a table cell of Table 459 are labeled as "informative" or "informational." Informative text shall be placed in notes (to text, tables, and figures), in footnotes within text, and in informative annexes. Interspersed normative and informative text is not allowed. As such, neither clauses nor subclauses shall be labeled as informative. Please change accordingly.

Suggested Remedy

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Principle

- (1) For Figure 3: Move subclause 1.4.4 into a new Annex N
- (2) for 7.2.2.2.9.1.3: move subclause to a new Annex O
- (3) for table 459:
 - (a) remove PAPR column from Table 459
 - (b) create a new Annex P that lists PAPR for given preamble modulation series index

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

9/16: deferred

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions h) pass off to other editor

Ron to create Annex N, O and P

Scott to remove PAPR column from Table 459

MSP -- Itzik to remove PAPR from Table 459. I deleted subclause 1.4.4 and subclause 7.2.2.2.9.1.3

2008/08/05

IEEE 802.16-08/049r3 coord

Comment by: Michelle Turner

Membership Status: Member

Date: 4-Sep-2008

Comment # 10

Document under Review: P802.16Rev2/D6a

Ballot ID: 802.16Rev2R0

Comment Type General Part of Dis Satisfied Page 0 Line 0 Fig/Table# Subclause 0

Many equations use multidots. From the IEEE Style Manual, "a multiplication sign, rather than the letter "x" or a multidot, should be used to indicate multiplication of numbers and numerical values. Please go through the equations and make the appropriate changes.

Suggested Remedy

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Agree

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions a) done

All editors to scan equations in their sections for multidots. Replace with the multiplication sign.

Editorial Coordination Comment in Third Recirculation of P802.16Rev2

From: *Michelle Turner*

Page: 2

Line: 2

Subclause: *[none]*

Category: *Editorial*

Comment: *The following references are not cited in text: IEEE Std 802, IETF RFC 1213, IETF RFC 1902, IETF RFC 1903, IETF RFC 2132, IETF RFC 2576, IETF RFC 2578, IETF RFC 3394, IETF RFC 341. They will need to be moved to the bibliography if they are needed for informative purposes only. However, if they are needed for the implementation of the standard, they will need be cited in text. If this is the case, a recirculation will be required.*

Proposed Change: *[none]*

Resolution Status: *Principle*

Resolution Detail: *Two of the normative references on this list - IEEE Std 802 and RFC 2578 - are in fact already cited directly in the text of the standard. Also, while the reference list does not include IETF RFC 341, it does include several of the form RFC 341N, but each of these is also cited in the text. It appears that RFC 1213, 1902, 1903, 2132, 2576, and 3394 are not cited in the text. Since they are not needed for the implementation of the standard, we have no objection to having each of these (RFC 1213, 1902, 1903, 2132, 2576, and 3394) moved from the References to the Bibliography when the final version is prepared for publication by the editorial staff.*

From: m.d.turner@ieee.org

Subject: **Re: response to P802.16 Revision recirculation coordination comment**

Date: 19 February 2009 6:32:17 AM MST

To: "Roger B. Marks" <r.b.marks@ieee.org>

Thanks Roger :-)

Michelle Turner
Program Manager, Document Development
IEEE Standards Activities
e-mail: m.d.turner@ieee.org

P802.16 Standard for Local and Metropolitan Area Networks - Part 16: Air Interface for Broadband Wireless Access Systems

Recirculation #4	Recirculation #3	Recirculation #2	Recirculation #1	Initial Ballot
----------------------------------	----------------------------------	----------------------------------	----------------------------------	--------------------------------

[Download/Upload Comment Response](#)

[Show All](#)

Comment # ▼	Name	Style	Index #	Classification	Vote	Affiliation	Category	Page	Sub-clause	Line #	Comment	File	Must Be Satisfied	Proposed Change	Resolution Status	Resolution Detail
1	Turner, Michelle	Editorial Coordination Coordination	1		N/A		General	0	0	0	Meets all editorial requirements.		Yes		Agree edit	