
Project	IEEE 802.16 Broadband Wireless Access Working Group < http://ieee802.org/16 >	
Title	Minutes of IEEE 802.16 Session #59	
Date Submitted	2009-02-08	
Source(s)	Peiyong Zhu Nortel	Voice: +1 613 7658089 mailto:pyzhu@nortel.com
Abstract	IEEE 802.16 Session #59 Minutes (San Diego, USA)	
Purpose	To record the minutes of the IEEE 802.16 Working Group Opening and Closing Plenary meetings at Session #59. For approval at Session #60.	
Release	The contributor grants a free, irrevocable license to the IEEE to incorporate material contained in this contribution, and any modifications thereof, in the creation of an IEEE Standards publication; to copyright in the IEEE's name any IEEE Standards publication even though it may include portions of this contribution; and at the IEEE's sole discretion to permit others to reproduce in whole or in part the resulting IEEE Standards publication. The contributor also acknowledges and accepts that this contribution may be made public by IEEE 802.16.	
Patent Policy and Procedures	The contributor is familiar with the IEEE-SA Patent Policy and Procedures: < http://standards.ieee.org/guides/bylaws/sect6-7.html#6 > and < http://standards.ieee.org/guides/opman/sect6.html#6.3 >. Further information is located at < http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-material.html > and < http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat >.	

Minutes of IEEE 802.16 Session #59

IEEE 802.16 Working Group

La Jolla, San Diego, USA

January 12-15, 2009

IEEE 802.16 Session #59 Opening Plenary Meeting

Jan. 12, 2009

Call to Order

The meeting was called to order by the Working Group (WG) Chair Roger Marks at 1:20 pm. He welcomed the attendees to Session #59 of the IEEE 802.16 WG. Roger provided the URL for the opening plenary agenda <<http://ieee802.org/16/meetings/mtg59/opening.html>>. Roger introduced himself and announced his change of affiliation, from NextWave Wireless to WiMAX Forum. The Working Group (WG) Vice Chair Jose Puthenkulam, affiliated with Intel, and Secretary Peiyang Zhu, affiliated with Nortel Networks, introduced themselves.

The Session #59 host, Lei Wang of NextWave Wireless, welcomed the attendees to La Jolla. Lei outlined the logistical and the registration issues..

Membership and Voting

The lists of WG Members, Potential Members, Members in Peril, and Observers were explained by the Chair. Voting tokens were embedded on the badges.

Attendance Log procedure: You must use the IEEE Automated Meeting Attendance Tool ("IMAT") if you wish to receive participation credit for this session. It is available at <<http://attendance.wirelessman.org>>. For the Meeting Access Code, use "16lj". This credit is essential to retaining or obtaining Working Group Membership or Observer status. In order to use IMAT, you must have an IEEE Web Account for use during the session. See [email notice](#) and [IEEE 802.16-08/036](#).

Attendance software's "Affiliation" field is the appropriate Affiliation field per [IEEE-SA affiliation disclosure requirements](#) and will be reported as such. There were 37 scheduled attendance credit hours, the "Participation" Requirement, nominally 75%, will be satisfied with 27 credit hours.

Roger then reviewed the agenda and noted that the agenda item of approving Session #58 minutes would be deferred to the Closing Plenary to allow sufficient time for review.

Roger asked for comments or concerns on the agenda. No comments were received.

Motion (at 1:35pm): "To approve the Opening Plenary Meeting Agenda as presented <<http://ieee802.org/16/meetings/mtg59/opening.html>>", moved by Mariana Goldhamer, seconded by David Johnston, passed with unanimous consent.

Chair's Report

Administrative, Procedural, and Announcements (see [Chair's Opening Plenary Presentation Slides](#)).

Roger reviewed the IEEE-SA affiliation disclosure requirements <<http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/affiliationFAQ.html>> and again reminded the WG attendees to fill in the affiliation field. Roger reviewed the "Ethics policy" <http://ieee.org/web/membership/ethics/code_ethics.htm>.

Roger displayed the patent policy materials <<http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-material.html>> and patent slides <<http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.pdf>>.

The following advice was provided by the WG Chair concerning IEEE Standards Association (IEEE-SA) rules regarding patents:

- The IEEE's patent policy is consistent with the ANSI patent policy and is described in Clause 6 of the *IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws*;
- Early identification of patent claims which may be essential for the use of standards under development is strongly encouraged;
- There may be Essential Patent Claims of which the IEEE is not aware. Additionally, neither the IEEE, the WG, nor the WG chair can ensure the accuracy or completeness of any assurance or whether any such assurance is, in fact, of a Patent Claim that is essential for the use of the standard under development.

Slide #1-#4 and slide #0 were shown. The slides are available at <<http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt>>.

An opportunity was provided for participants to identify patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) of which the participant is personally aware and that may be essential for the use of that standard. No comments arose. Roger emphasized that the Bylaws take precedence over the patent slides and encouraged people to read the Bylaws if they have questions.

There were no other responses on the patent topic.

Roger showed the link to the IEEE 802.16-specific Letters of Assurance in IEEE-SA patent database <http://standards.ieee.org/db/patents/pat802_16.html>.

Roger advised TG chairs regarding reiteration of the Call for Patents.

IEEE 802 P&P issues

Roger highlighted parts of the IEEE 802 Policies and Procedures (P&P) <<http://ieee802.org/devdocs.html>> as shown in the opening slides in document IEEE 802.16-09/0002, in particular, issues related to WG operation, Chair's function, WG Rules such as working group domination, copyrights, contribution procedures.

Review of Session #58 Report

Roger reviewed the [Session #58 Report](#) and strongly encouraged the group to read the report to get familiar with the group's progress.

Session #59 Document Guide

Roger reviewed the [Session #59 Document Guide](#).

Schedule for the Week

The schedule for the week was presented for the various task groups and ad hoc groups <<http://dot16.org/cal/week.php?getdate=20090112>>.

TGm

The TGm Chair, Brian Kiernan presented the opening report (document C802.16m-09/0005). Brian reviewed the plan for the week.

License-Exempt Task Group

The LE TG Chair, Mariana Goldhamer, presented the opening report (document IEEE 802.16h-09/0001), including the Sponsor Ballot Recirc status on IEEE P802.16h/D8, the plan for the week and expected motions for the WG Closing Plenary

Relay Task Group

The Relay TG Chair, Mitsuo Nohara, presented the opening report (document IEEE 802.16j-09/0001), including the status of the Sponsor Ballot on IEEE P802.16j/D8, plans for the week and expected motions for the WG Closing Plenary.

Maintenance Task Group

The Maintenance TG Chair, Jonathan Labs, presented the opening report (IEEE 802.16maint-09/0001), including the status of the Sponsor Ballot Recirc on P802.16Rev2/D8, the plan for the week and expected motions for the WG Closing Plenary.

ITU-R Liaison Group

Raza Af efi serving as the Acting Chair, due to the absence of Chair José Costa. He presented the opening report (IEEE L802.16-09/0003).

WG Ad Hoc Committee on Network Robustness and Reliability

The Ad-Hoc Chair, Arnaud Tonnerre, presented the opening report (IEEE 802.16-09/0007) of the WG Ad Hoc Committee on Network Robustness and Reliability.

Schedule for the week

Roger reviewed the updated schedule for the week.

Sponsor Ballot comment resolution requirements

Roger reminded the TG chairs to follow the proper comment resolution procedures for Sponsor Ballot.

Future Sessions

- Session #60: 9-12 March 2009 in Vancouver, Canada with IEEE 802 Plenary Session
- Session #61: 4-7 May 2009 in Cairo, Egypt: Interim Session, hosted by National Telecom Regulatory Authority of Egypt (NTRA)
- Session #62: 13-16 July 2009 in San Francisco, California, USA with IEEE 802 Plenary Session
- Session #63: 31 August - 3 September 2009 in Jeju, Korea: Interim Session, hosted by Samsung.
- 1 - 25 September 2009: Special meeting in Waikoloa, Hawaii, USA. 802.16 Delegation to attend session of IEEE 802.18 TAG to review IMT-Advanced proposal. Venue could also be used for special meeting of TGM, possibly limited to special topics.
- Session #64: 16-19 Nov 2009 in Atlanta, Georgia, USA with IEEE 802 Plenary Session
- Session #65: Jan 2010: Interim Session; site to be determined at Closing Plenary of Session #60

Proposals solicited; please see IEEE 802.16 Interim Session Guidelines.

New Business

Roger informed the group that he scheduled a meeting slot to discuss the WG reorganization issue on Wed at 2:00pm. Roger also informed the group of the Monday open office hours as indicated in the interactive schedule. Attendees may bring any issues to the Chair during the open office hours. Roger welcomed the TG chairs to join him for the open office. Bob Grow, Chair of the IEEE-SA Standards Board, volunteered to be present in the open office at 6:00pm on Monday night.

Ranga Reddy provided a short summary of the 802 Executive Committee Study Group on White Space. The following main activities were reported:

1. Development of use cases, which were classified by output power.
2. Discussion on coexistence
3. Security, mainly protection of incumbents
4. Develop common language across the WGs

Mariana Goldhamer added that the main objective of the Study Group is to develop a recommendation for the March Plenary meeting.

Motion (3:15pm) “*To adjourn the meeting*”, moved by David Johnston, seconded by Scott Probasco, passed by unanimous voice vote.

IEEE 802.16 Session #59 Closing Plenary Meeting

15 Jan. 2009

Call to Order

Roger called the meeting to order at 8:05 pm.

Patent Policy Slides

Chair reminded the attendees the IEEE 802 patent policy.

<http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.pdf>

An opportunity was provided for participants to identify patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) of which the participant is personally aware and that may be essential for the use of that standard. No comments arose.

Approval of Agenda

The Closing Plenary agenda <<http://iee802.org/16/meetings/mtg59/closing.html>> was reviewed.

Motion (8:15pm): *“To approve the Closing Plenary agenda < <http://iee802.org/16/meetings/mtg59/closing.htm>>”,* moved by Phil Barber, seconded by David Johnston, approved with unanimous voice vote.

Session #59 Info

The meeting host Lei Wang explained the logistics and passed along the message that the session hotel has offered to accommodate the future January sessions. Roger commented that this hotel has excellent facilities and that the group may want to seriously consider the offer.

Maintenance Task Group

A report was presented by the TG Chair, Jon Labs (IEEE 802.16maint-09/0004r1).

Motion (8:25pm): *“To accept the resolutions of the comments from the Rev2 Sponsor Ballot Recirc R2, as recorded in IEEE 802.16-08/064r2, to develop draft P802.16Rev2/D9 according to those resolutions, and to initiate a Sponsor Confirmation Ballot.”*, moved by Jon Labs, seconded by Ron Murias, passed by 48/0/0.

Mitsuo Nohara requested to make P802.16Rev2/D9 available before Feb. 2 so that the Relay TG can align its draft to Rev2 and initiate sponsor confirmation ballot before Feb. 6. Jon believed that an early draft could be provided to the Relay TG. Roger requested that Nohara-san send a list of email addresses to the Maintenance TG Editor Joe Schumacher so that he can send the draft to them as soon as the document is ready.

Motion (8:32pm): *“To request the 802.16 WG to forward P802.16Rev2/D9 to RevCom”*, moved by Jon Labs, seconded by Lei Wang, passed by 44/0/0.

Motion (8:33pm): *“To authorize the 802.16 WG Chair and 802.16 Maint TG Chair to resolve any comments received during the P802.16Rev2 Sponsor Ballot Recirculation.”*, moved by David Johnston, seconded by Phil Barber, passed by 45/0/0.

Motion (8:35pm): *“To empower the 802.16 WG Chair to do editorial reference updates to external documents in P802.16Rev2/D9 if necessary.”*, moved by Jon Labs, seconded by Shawn Taylor, passed by 48/0/0.

Session #59

Roger requested to interrupt the agenda item so that the meeting host Lei Wang can make an announcement.

Lei Wang expressed her appreciation to the meeting organizers, Dawn Slykhouse and Lisa Ronmark, for their excellent support.

License-Exempt Task Group

A report was made by the TG Chair, Mariana Goldhamer (IEEE 802.16h-09/0003).

Motion (8:42pm): *“To authorize the LE TG Editor to create the WG draft IEEE P802.16h/D9 based on the comment resolutions recorded in the data-base IEEE 802.16-08/065r3 and to initiate a Sponsor Recirculation Ballot”*, moved by Mariana Goldhamer, seconded by Xuyong Wu.

Phil Barber commented that the database *IEEE 802.16-08/065r3* has not been uploaded onto the server yet and requested to review several comment resolutions associated with the disapproval voters, specifically comments A7 and A8. Mariana reviewed the resolutions of comments #A7 and #A8.

Lei Wang asked the WG Chair to clarify the definition of the term “Principle” used for sponsor ballot comment resolution. Roger explained that there is no exact definition of “Principle” from IEEE-SA, but it is generally understood by the WG that “Principle” is roughly equivalent to “Accept-Modified” used by in WG comment resolution.

An inquiry was made regarding the number of participants in the LE TG this session. Mariana responded that there were 4 participants.

Roger asked to review Comment A9 and its resolution.

There was lengthy discussion of these comments and their proposed resolutions. The discussion evolved around whether the draft contains physical layer modifications, which were argued to be out of the project’s scope. There was also a suggestion from Jose Puthenkulam to request a PAR modification to allow PHY changes if it is necessary instead of debating the scope.

The motion was voted.
Motion failed: 10/25/9.

Motion (9:42pm): *“To authorize the LE TG Editor to create the WG draft IEEE P802.16h/D9 based on the comment resolutions recorded in the data-base IEEE 802.16-08/065r3 and issue a WG call for comments.”*, moved by Mariana Goldhamer, seconded by Naftali Chayat.

There was discussion on the floor. Several people spoke against the motion and preferred that the TG rework the resolutions of the comments in question instead of creating a new draft, while others spoke for the motion in order to move forward.

The motion was voted.

Motion passed: 28/7/6.

Relay Task Group

A report was made by the Relay TG Chair, Mitsuo Nohara (IEEE 802.16j-09/0002r2).

Motion (9:57pm): *” To approve P802.16j/D9 (to be issued by the Relay TG Editors) as the revised working group draft and to authorize the WG Chair to proceed to the Sponsor Ballot confirmation recirculation, to start before 6 Feb. 2009 and to authorize the WG Chair to submit the P802.16j/D9 to RevCom.”*, moved by Mitsuo Nohara, seconded by Michiharu Nakamura., passed by 55/0/0.

Motion (10:01pm): *“To authorize the TG Chair team to resolve the comments received during the recirculation and issue the revised draft based on the resolutions”*, moved by Mitsuo Nohara, seconded by Brian Kiernan, passed by 36/0/0.

TGm

A report was presented by the TGm Chair, Brian Kiernan (IEEE 802.16m-09/0009).

Roger asked Brian whether there is a list of output documents and scheduled document issue dates. Brian replied that the following documents will be updated:

- SRD, updated and available,

- EMD, updated and available
- SDD, available within approximately two weeks
- AMD, available on Jan 29

Roger asked if there will be any call for contributions/comments for the next session. Brian replied that there is a plan to issue call for comments/contributions for the SDD and AMD.

WG Ad Hoc Committee on Network Robustness and Reliability

The Ad-Hoc chair Arnaud Tonnerre presented the report (IEEE 802.16-09/0008).

Roger asked about the number of participants at the Ad Hoc meeting. Arnaud replied that there were up to 27 participants. Roger requested the chair to continue the Ad Hoc Committee activity through the next WG Session.

ITU-R Liaison Group

Raza Arefi provided the report of the meeting of the ITU-R Liaison Group during Session #59 (L80216-09/0009) and reviewed several output documents from the ITU-R Liaison Group listed in the report.

Motion (10:26pm): *“To adopt all motions in the report (L80216-09/0009), subject to suitable editorial changes”*, moved by Ron Marius, seconded by Brian Kiernan, passed by 43/0/0.

Future Sessions <<http://ieee802.org/16/calendar.html>>

- Session #60: 9-12 March 2009 in Vancouver, Canada with IEEE 802 Plenary Session
- Session #61: 4-7 May 2009 in Cairo, Egypt: Interim Session, hosted by National Telecom Regulatory Authority of Egypt (NTRA)

Ahmed Shalash presented the update (IEEE C802.16-09/0001). Dan Gal asked if there are any security concerns. The answer was “no”.

- Session #62: 13-16 July 2009 in San Francisco, California, USA with IEEE 802 Plenary Session
- Session #63: 31 August - 3 September 2009 in Jeju, Korea: Interim Session, hosted by Samsung.

Hoky Choi provided a short verbal update to confirm that meeting plan is on track.

- 21-25 September 2009: Special meeting in Waikoloa, Hawaii, USA. 802.16 Delegation to attend session of IEEE 802.18 TAG to review IMT-Advanced proposal. Venue could also be used for special meeting of TGM, possibly limited to special topics. Several people spoke in favor of holding such a session. No one spoke against it.
- Session #64: 16-19 Nov 2009 in Atlanta, Georgia, USA with IEEE 802 Plenary Session
- Session #65: Jan 2010: Interim Session; site to be determined at Closing Plenary of Session #60. *Proposals solicited*; please see [IEEE 802.16 Interim Session Guidelines](#). Roger asked if there are any potential proposals. No response arose. Roger reminded the group that current venue was offered this same facility for next January.

Publicity

The Chair was authorized, without objection, to prepare the Session #59 Report .

Approval of Minutes of IEEE 802.16 Session #58

Motion (10:42pm): *“To approve the Minutes of IEEE 802.16 Session #58 (IEEE 802.16-08/060)”*, moved by David Johnston, seconded by Carl Eklund, motion passed with unanimous voice consent.

New Business

Roger reported that a two hour meeting was held on Wed to discuss the WG reorganization issue. There were 14 participants. Roger planed to post a report to the E-mail refelctor set up for WG discussions organizations discussions.

Closing

A Motion to adjourn the meeting was made by Lei Wang, seconded by Rakesh Taori.
Roger asked the group to give the round of applause to the meeting host Lei Wang for the excellent job and to approve the motion.

The meeting was adjourned at 10:50pm.

Web References

Session #59 Web Page

<http://ieee802.org/16/meetings/mtg59>

Session #59 Attendance and Participation List

<http://ieee802.org/16/meetings/mtg59/reglist.html>

Session #59 Report

<http://ieee802.org/16/meetings/mtg59/report.html>