

Comment by: Daniel Lubar

Membership Status: Member

Date: 7-Jan-2009 10:55: 7 EST

Comment # B71

Document under Review:

Ballot ID: sb_16jR2

Comment Type General Part of Dis Satisfied Page ? Line 47 Fig/Table# Subclause

In Rev2 D8, despite the the fact that the Bibliography presented in Annex A is informative, I would urge that amendment j's TG work to update the references for the sake of quality/accuracy. A specific example is the reference to the 802.11 Standard [B28] which still points at the 1997 baseline. FYI the current 802.11 baseline is really a 2008 document. I would guess that some of the IETF & ITU documents are also in need of a refresh too.

Suggested Remedy

Undertake to refresh Annex A's document references.. Here is the refresh for [B28]..
Replace the existing text with at least the the 2007 baseline reference.. ie "[B28] IEEE Std 802.11(TM)-2007, IEEE Standard for Information Technology--Telecommunications and information exchange between systems--LANs and MANs--Specific requirements--Part 11: WLAN MAC and PHY Specifications"

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Out of Scope

Response: This comment is out of scope of the ballot. The P802.16j Sponsor Ballot Group is not authorized to develop amendments to the underlying base standard.

Remedy: Since the base standard is currently under revision and in ballot, the comment has been forwarded to the Ballot Resolution Committee for that revision project. According to our understanding, that Committee has agreed to address the comment and will communicate its response to the voter. The P802.16j Sponsor Ballot Group will be provided with the base document and can therefore confirm any resultant changes.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions b) none needed

Comment by: Ronald G Murias

Membership Status: Member

Date: 10-Sep-2008

Comment # 373

Document under Review:

Ballot ID: 802.16jR0

Comment Type General Part of Dis Satisfied Page 1 Line 45 Fig/Table# Subclause 1.1

Page 1 line 38 says: "Temporary note: All references in this version of the draft amendment are relative to P802.16Rev2/D5 (June 2008)."

The IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual states in 1.2 that an amendment is "A document that contains new material to an existing IEEE standard and may contain technical corrections to that standard."

This amendment appears to have been written to amend an unapproved working draft of a revision.

Suggested Remedy

Re-write the amendment to contain new material to an existing IEEE standard.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Principle

Group agree the comments.

Group has started the ad hoc for alignment with Rev2 draft before entering sponsor ballot.

And group made alignment with D5 and approved the text changes required for alignment with D6a.

And ad hoc group will keep the work for alignment with Rev2 until it release as standard.

Please refer to 08/144 and 08/145r1 for the result of alignment to Rev2/D5 and Rev2/D6a.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions b) none needed