

Project	IEEE 802.16 Broadband Wireless Access Working Group < http://ieee802.org/16 >	
Title	Record of Discussions with IETF Liaison to IEEE 802	
Date Submitted	2005-03-09	
Source(s)	Roger B. Marks Chair, IEEE 802.16 Working Group	Voice: +1 303 497 7837 marks@nist.gov
Re:		
Abstract	This is a record of a conference call with IETF's Liaison to IEEE 802 regarding possible interactions between IETF and the IEEE 802.16 Working Group.	
Purpose	To brief the Working Group in preparation for drafting a liaison statement at Session #36.	
Notice	This document has been prepared to assist IEEE 802.16. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.	
Release	The contributor grants a free, irrevocable license to the IEEE to incorporate material contained in this contribution, and any modifications thereof, in the creation of an IEEE Standards publication; to copyright in the IEEE's name any IEEE Standards publication even though it may include portions of this contribution; and at the IEEE's sole discretion to permit others to reproduce in whole or in part the resulting IEEE Standards publication. The contributor also acknowledges and accepts that this contribution may be made public by IEEE 802.16.	
Patent Policy and Procedures	The contributor is familiar with the IEEE 802.16 Patent Policy and Procedures < http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/policy.html >, including the statement "IEEE standards may include the known use of patent(s), including patent applications, provided the IEEE receives assurance from the patent holder or applicant with respect to patents essential for compliance with both mandatory and optional portions of the standard." Early disclosure to the Working Group of patent information that might be relevant to the standard is essential to reduce the possibility for delays in the development process and increase the likelihood that the draft publication will be approved for publication. Please notify the Chair < mailto:chair@wirelessman.org > as early as possible, in written or electronic form, if patented technology (or technology under patent application) might be incorporated into a draft standard being developed within the IEEE 802.16 Working Group. The Chair will disclose this notification via the IEEE 802.16 web site < http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/notices >.	

Record of Discussions with IETF Liaison to IEEE 802

Roger B. Marks

Chair, IEEE 802.16 Working Group

Abstract

This is a record of a conference call with IETF's Liaison to IEEE 802 regarding possible interactions between IETF and the IEEE 802.16 Working Group.

Background

I was contacted in early February by Bernard Aboba and Jari Arkko, chairs of the IETF EAP Working Group. They had received an inquiry related to 802.16 and EAP. They wrote:

The EAP WG has completed work on RFC 3748, which imposes requirements for lower layer support of EAP. In addition, the EAP WG is currently working on the EAP Key Management Framework, which analyzes the security of the EAP/AAA/lower layer system, and describes the EAP key management model. The focus of the current work is to clarify the security properties of the system, and address questions that have arisen within implementations of EAP such as 802.11i. In this process we have also solicited review from the security community.

In the past, we have worked with other IEEE 802 task groups, such as IEEE 802.11i, which also incorporates support for EAP. Dorothy Stanley, the IEEE 802.11 liaison to IETF, very ably represented 802.11 in that capacity, and continues to do so. The appointment of a liaison is helpful because it ensures that communications are authorized by the WG, rather than just being the opinion of a participant.

In order to understand how we should address this request, and how 802.16e and EAP WG can best work together, we would propose to schedule a conference call at your convenience.

I replied:

I appreciate your points about a possible liaison relationship. We certainly encourage such relationships when we have common work to do. It is possible that the 802.16 WG would benefit from a relationship with the EAP WG, but we have not yet discussed it. We can certainly do so at our next session, the week of March 14. I will check the Working Group's level of interest and determine if we have any liaison volunteers.

I can let you know the outcome following our session.

I have copied Brian Kiernan, the Chair of 802.16's Task Group e, because that project has been developing (among many other things) some security enhancements to the published IEEE Standard 802.16-2004.

In early March, 802.16 Potential Member Mike Geipel wrote that he had had a conversation with IETF participants regarding the possibility of IETF reviewing the MIB in P802.16f. He also provided some information about the IETF MIB review process.

Following an additional email with Bernard Aboba regarding possible means of coordination, we arranged a conference call for 9 March.

Summary of Conference Call of 9 March 2005

A conference call was held on 9 March. The 802.16 participants were Roger Marks (WG Chair), Brian Kiernan (TGe Chair), Phil Barber (NetMan TG Chair, and 802.16 representative on 802 Architecture Group), and David Johnston (802.16 representative on 802 Architecture Group). The IETF participants were Bernard Aboba (IETF EAP WG co-chair, IETF liaison to 802, and IETF IAB member) and Jari Arkko (IETF EAP WG co-chair). Dorothy Stanley, the IEEE 802.11 liaison to IETF, also participated.

Mr. Aboba noted that he had met with IEEE 802 in January 2004 (author's note: see report posted as <http://www.drizzle.com/~aboba/IEEE/coord.ppt>). That meeting led to the suggestion that draft IEEE 802 MIBs be reviewed by a "MIB Doctor" in IETF <http://ops.ietf.org/mib-doctors.html>. Mr. Aboba indicated that Bert Wijnen would review the draft MIB in P802.16f. He can relay his comments to the WG or TG Chair for entry into Sponsor Ballot. Phil Barber agreed to forward the draft MIB, in machine-readable format, to Mr. Wijnen.

We proceeded to discuss EAP. Mr. Aboba had recently learned that EAP is referenced in P802.16. He noted his concern in that EAP includes many detailed requirements, many related to key-caching. If P802.16e is not to include key-caching, Mr. Aboba suggested that the WG request a basic review of conformance to 3748. IETF receives a number of such requests. If the draft works within an existing EAP mode, then the conformance review may be relatively straightforward. However, if it does not, then the problem is more difficult. In principle, IETF could consider the development of a new mode. However, this would be time-consuming, since it would require a standards process, not a review process. In general, it will be important to ascertain whether P802.16e is pointing to existing EAP content or to some draft content. If we are finding it important to reference work that is incomplete, we should notify IETF as soon as possible, and provide our timeline, so that IETF ensures that the referenced work is given a high priority for completion.

Mr. Aboba suggested that the 802.16 WG name someone as IETF liaison official. Mr. Marks indicated that the Working Group would attempt to do so at its Session #36 next week. It would also prepare a letter to IETF.

The 802.16 Chair thanked the IETF participants for their time and for their gracious assistance.