

IEEE 802.16 Working Group on Broadband Wireless Access

<http://WirelessMAN.org>



Roger B. Marks
 Chair, IEEE 802.16 Working Group
 rmarks@nextwave.com
 19 September 2008

To: Mike Lynch
 Chair, IEEE 802.18 TAG

Subject: Comments on IEEE 802.18-08-0058/r4 (“IEEE 802.18 IMT-Advanced Review Process”)

Dear Mike,

The IEEE 802.16 Working Group has reviewed IEEE 802.18-08-0058/r4 (“IEEE 802.18 IMT-Advanced Review Process”). We appreciate the thought, consideration, and effort that has gone into the refinement of this proposal. The 802.16 Working Group is hereby submitting some comments for the consideration of the 802.18 TAG.

(a) In the second bullet on Slide 8, Options 1 and 2 are not incompatible. We suggest changing “one of the following actions” to “one or both of the following actions” and dropping the word “Alternatively” from Option 2. If both options were agreed, then 802.18 could complete the work, but the Working Groups would still have a fallback position in case of any late problems within 802.18.

(b) We do not fully understand the references to 30 Sept as the “last date for 802.18 approval of proposals”. Since the 802.18 session is scheduled to end on 25 Sept, it seems that this would be the right date. We would prefer to not have this done in an 802.18 conference call. If 802.18 does not conclude the work during the session, it would be appropriate turn the work over to the EC.

(c) Regarding the third bullet on Slide 8, the meaning of “attend” is not clear. Does this mean that the WG should hold an interim session there? If so, then it is not clear to us why this would matter, especially if the materials were due a month in advance. In fact, the deadline requires the 802.16 Working Group to plan for a very early interim session. We do see the value in having adequate and authorized WG representation to handle any issue that requires decisions that might alter the documents. If that is what “attend” means, then we see no problem with the concept. To clarify the issue, we suggest that the text be changed to: “802.18 further recommends that all WGs participating in the IMT-Advanced process provide authorized representatives to the September 2009 Interim Session of the IEEE 802.18 TAG to expedite the IMT-Advanced approval process.”

(d) We strongly support the “Accelerated Process” outlined, with some adjustment of the lead time. In fact, we believe that an accelerated process is vital to a competitive IEEE 802 proposal. For your reference, we have attached our current ITU activity workplan. As you can see, we will need to operate on a very tight schedule to complete the work next autumn.

(e) We very much appreciate the note on the last slide that “802.18 will review the schedule to determine if it is reasonable to shorten the lead time for 802.18 review of full submissions by WGs.” In the proposed Accelerated Process, the lead time remains longer than we would prefer. We believe that it is worth looking closely at exactly how much work it would take 802.18 to make a judgement of completeness. We are happy to work with 802.18 to scope out the project and see if

the lead time can be shortened. Unnecessary lead time will reduce the quality of the output and make it more difficult for IEEE to mount a proposal that is fully competitive with other IMT-Advanced proposals from outside IEEE.

We look forward to further cooperative interactions.

Regards,

Roger

cc: José Costa, Chair, IEEE 802.16 ITU-R Liaison Group
Reza Arefi, IEEE 802.16 Liaison to 802.18 TAG
Paul Nikolich, Chair, IEEE 802 Executive Committee

IEEE 802.16 ITU-R Liaison Group Workplan

The following table represents a workplan for the IEEE 802.16 ITU-R Liaison Group based on ITU-R and IEEE events relevant to the IEEE 802.16 Working Group.

Note: Highlighted items are related to IMT-Advanced.

Group/Event	#	Start	# days	End	Location	Actions/Comments
IEEE 802.18		8-Sep-08	5(4?)	12-Sep-08	Kona, HI, USA	
IEEE 802.16	57	16-Sep-08	4	19-Sep-08	Kobe, Japan	- Need for ITU-R Liaison Group meeting in September 2008 is not currently anticipated. - Identify acting chair of ITU-R Liaison Group for November meeting. - Prepare contribution for the IMT-Advanced workshop
						- No time for IEEE 802 EC correspondence activity to approve contribution(s) to ITU-R.
WiMAX Forum		22-Sep-08	5	26-Sep-08	Macao, China	
WP 5D contr. Due:				1-Oct-08		
IMT-Adv Workshop		07-Oct-08		07-Oct-08	Seoul, Korea	- Presentation by Jose Costa
ITU-R WP 5D	3	08-Oct-08	8	15-Oct-08	Seoul, Korea	
WP 5A contr. Due:				21-Oct-08		
ITU-R WP 5A	2	28-Oct-08	10	06-Nov-08	Geneva, CH	
SG5 contr. Due:				3-Nov-08		
ITU-R SG5	2	10-Nov-08	2	11-Nov-08	Geneva, CH	
IEEE 802.16	58	10-Nov-08	4	13-Nov-08	Dallas, TX	- Plan for the IMT-Advanced submission in 2009 - Prepare Step 1 contribution towards IMT-Advanced - Prepare the third contribution on IMT-2000 Rev. 9 - Consider SG 5 results
IEEE 802.18		10-Nov-08	5	14-Nov-08	Dallas, TX	- Definition of IMT-Advanced submission process in IEEE 802.18
IEEE 802		10-Nov-08	5	14-Nov-08	Dallas, TX	- Definition of IMT-Advanced submission process in IEEE 802, with minimized lead time - Approval of Step 1 contribution by the EC
IEEE 802.16	59	12-Jan-09	4	15-Jan-09	La Jolla, CA, USA	
IEEE 802.18		19-Jan-09	5	23-Jan-09	Los Angeles, CA, USA	

WP 5D contr. Due:				4-Feb-09		- deadline for submission of contributions approved in Nov 08 - Deadline for letters of conveyance for IMT-2000 Rev. 9
WiMAX Forum		5-Feb-09	6	10-Feb-09	Orlando, FL, USA	
ITU-R WP 5D	4	11-Feb-09	8	18-Feb-09	[India]	- Present Step 1 contribution towards IMT-Advanced
IEEE 802.16	60	9-Mar-09	4	12-Mar-09	Vancouver, BC, Canada	- Prepare Step 2 contribution towards IMT-Advanced - Call for Contributions on simulation package
IEEE 802		9-Mar-09	5	13-Mar-09	Vancouver, BC, Canada	- Approval of Step 2 contribution by the EC
IEEE 802.16	61	4-May-09	4	7-May-09	Cairo, Egypt	- Initiate draft Step 3 contribution towards IMT-Advanced - Review simulation package proposals - Call for Contributions on SDD evaluation
IEEE 802.18		11-May-09	5	15-May-09	Montreal, Canada	
WP 5A contr. Due:				11-May-09		
ITU-R WP 5A		18-May-09	12	29-May-09	Geneva, CH	
WP 5D contr. Due:				3-Jun-09		
ITU-R WP 5D	5	10-Jun-09	7	16-Jun-09	[Germany]	- Present Step 2 contribution towards IMT-Advanced
IEEE 802.16	62	13-Jul-09	5	17-Jul-09	San Francisco, CA, USA	- Update draft Step 3 contribution towards IMT-Advanced, including draft evaluation results
IEEE 802.18		13-Jul-09	5	17-Jul-09	San Francisco, CA, USA	- Review draft Step 3 contribution with 802.18
IEEE 802		13-Jul-09	5	17-Jul-09	San Francisco, CA, USA	
WP 5D deadline				3-Aug-09		- certification of references and transposition for M.1457-9
IEEE 802.16	63	31-Aug-09	5	3-Sep-09	Korea	- Conclude Step 3 contribution towards IMT-Advanced
IEEE 802.18 contr. Due:				2-Sep-09		- Deadline for Step 3 contribution towards IMT-Advanced
IEEE 802.18		21-Sep-09		25-Sep-09	Kona, HI, USA	- Delegation from 802.16 expected to attend.
WP 5D contr. Due:				7-Oct-09		
ITU-R WP 5D	6	14-Oct-09	8	21-Oct-09	[China]	- Present Step 3 contribution towards IMT-Advanced

Note: Regarding IMT-Advanced deadlines in IEEE 802, the above timeline assumes the “Accelerated EC Approval Process” according to IEEE 802.18 document [802.18-08/0058r4](#).