

Project	IEEE 802.16 Broadband Wireless Access Working Group < http://ieee802.org/16 >	
Title	Maintenance Task Group Session #36 Minutes	
Date Submitted	2005-03-29	
Source(s)	Jonathan Labs Wavesat, Inc. 1375 Trans-Canada Hwy Dorval, Qc H9P 2W8 Canada	Voice: +1 514 684 0200 x325 Fax: +1 514 684 0211 mailto:jlabs@wavesat.com
Re:	Maintenance Task Group Session #36 Minutes	
Abstract	Maintenance Task Group Session #36 Minutes	
Purpose	Maintenance Task Group Session #36 Minutes	
Notice	This document has been prepared to assist IEEE 802.16. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.	
Release	The contributor grants a free, irrevocable license to the IEEE to incorporate material contained in this contribution, and any modifications thereof, in the creation of an IEEE Standards publication; to copyright in the IEEE's name any IEEE Standards publication even though it may include portions of this contribution; and at the IEEE's sole discretion to permit others to reproduce in whole or in part the resulting IEEE Standards publication. The contributor also acknowledges and accepts that this contribution may be made public by IEEE 802.16.	
Patent Policy and Procedures	The contributor is familiar with the IEEE 802.16 Patent Policy and Procedures < http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/policy.html >, including the statement "IEEE standards may include the known use of patent(s), including patent applications, provided the IEEE receives assurance from the patent holder or applicant with respect to patents essential for compliance with both mandatory and optional portions of the standard." Early disclosure to the Working Group of patent information that might be relevant to the standard is essential to reduce the possibility for delays in the development process and increase the likelihood that the draft publication will be approved for publication. Please notify the Chair < mailto:chair@wirelessman.org > as early as possible, in written or electronic form, if patented technology (or technology under patent application) might be incorporated into a draft standard being developed within the IEEE 802.16 Working Group. The Chair will disclose this notification via the IEEE 802.16 web site < http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/notices >.	

Maintenance Task Group Session #36 Minutes

*Jonathan Labs
Wavesat, Inc.*

Maintenance Corrigendum Task Group
Session #36, Atlanta, Georgia, USA

March 14, 2005

Opened the TG Maintenance meeting at 4:15 PM

Reviewed procedure for the week.

Reviewed agenda for the week.

Approved the minutes of session 35 by unanimous voice vote.

Started comment resolution on database 80216-05_015.USR.

Broke for dinner at 6:15 PM.

Resumed at 7:50 PM.

Generated 80216-05_015_temp1.USR which contains comment resolutions as of the end of the Monday evening session, and includes 13 late comments and 1 missed comment originally submitted on time. Submitted to the Maintenance upload server.

Broke for the night at 9:58 PM.

March 15, 2005

Resumed at 8: AM.

Continued comment resolution on database 80216-05_015_temp1.USR.

Broke for lunch at 12:10 AM.

Resumed at 1:20 PM.

Broke for dinner at 6:10 PM.

Resumed at 7:30 PM.

Generated 80216-05_015_Temp3.USR which contains comment resolutions as of the end of the Tuesday evening session. Submitted to the Maintenance upload server.

Adjourned at 10:30 PM.

March 16, 2005

Started at 8:12 AM.

Continued comment resolution on database 80216-05_015_Temp3.USR.

Comment 212 is ruled Out of Scope by TG Chair as it is seen as an optimization/enhancement.

Mark Cudak makes the motion: "To rule Comment 212 in scope." Seconded by Ran Yaniv.

Vote on the motion:

In favor: 23

opposed: 3

abstain: 5

Motion passes.

Vote on the motion to accept comment 212:

In favor: 26

Opposed: 4

Abstain: 3

Motion passes.

Comment 173 ruled Out of Scope by TG Chair.

Motion to rule in scope: Tal Kaitz, seconded by Shlomo Ovadia

In favor: 12

Opposed: 28

Abstain: 1

Motion fails.

Comment 175 ruled Out of Scope by TG Chair.

Motion to rule in scope: Tal Kaitz, seconded by Ran Yaniv

In favor: 10

Opposed: 12

Abstain: 1

Motion fails.

Comment 179 ruled Out of Scope by TG Chair.

Motion to rule in scope: Ran Yaniv, Tal Kaitz seconds it.

In favor: 8

Opposed: 10

Abstain: 2

Motion fails.

Broke for lunch at 12:15 PM.

Resumed at 1:17 PM.

Comment 13 discussed.

Hostile motion to accept the text as modified in Resolution of the Group, forwarded by Itzik Kitroser, seconded Joël Demarty.

Chair asks for discussion, but no discussion follows.

6 in favor

4 opposed

1 abstain

Chair warns that 219 will be ruled out of scope

Discussion follows as to whether the group feels that 219 is in scope or out of scope.

Vote to call the question:

In favor: 39

Against: 0

Abstain: 1

Comment 219 is ruled out of scope by TG Chair

Motion to rule comment 219 as in scope: by Tal Kaitz, seconded by Hassan Yaghoobi

In favor: 42

Against: 38

Abstain: 1

Motion fails.

Comment 221 is ruled out of scope by TG Chair.

Motion to rule the comment in scope by Ran Yaniv, seconded by Dov Adelman

In Favor: 34

Against: 38

Absain: 0

Motion fails.

Comment 147 is ruled out of scope by TG Chair.

Motion to rule the comment in scope by Shlomo Ovadia, Pieter-Paul Giesberts

In favor: 6

Against: 9

Abstain: 0

Motion fails.

TG Chair reverses decision to rule out of scope, as discussion on comment 141 identifies an ambiguity.

Author requested to reject the comment on the grounds that the solution is not technically complete

Broke at 6:00 PM.

Resumed at 9:05 PM

Generated 80216-05_015_Temp6.USR which contains comment resolutions as of the end of the Wednesday evening session. Submitted to the Maintenance upload server.

Broke at 11:35 PM

March 17, 2005

Resumed at 8:10 AM.

Continued comment resolution on database 80216-05_015_Temp6.USR.

Comment 280 is ruled out of scope by TG Chair.

Ambroise Popper makes motion to rule comment 280 in scope. Joël Demarty seconds the motion.

In favor: 6

Against: 4

Motion fails.

Late comment submitted by Ambroise Popper. Incorporated into the database to generate 80216-05_015_Temp7.USR, which also contains the comments resolutions up to Thursday noon.

Broke for lunch at 12:10 PM.

Resumed at 1:25 PM.

Incorporated 4 more late comments from Mike Geipel, and generated 80216-05_015_Temp8.USR. 80216-05_015_Temp8.USR submitted to the Maintenance upload server.

Continue comment resolutions on 80216-05_015_Temp8.USR.

Comment 311:

Straw poll on suggested remedy options:

- 1) Do nothing, In favor: 0
- 2) Explicitly define whether IP datagram encapsulation shall follow the Ethernet or the 802.3/LLC/SNAP format for SMC. In favor: 0
- 3) Specify that subscribers must support both for SMC. In favor 1
- 4) Restore IP CS as an option for SMC. In favor 11

See 80216-05_015r1.USR for the final remedy chosen by the group for comment 311.

Close database 80216-05_015_temp8.USR, generating 80216-05_015r1 containing all resolved comments.

Uploaded 80216-05_015r1 to the Maintenance upload directory. Final statistics on the comments are:

- Total: 319 Late: 20
- Accepted/Accepted-Modified: 188
- Rejected: 52
- Superseded: 44
- Withdrawn: 21
- Out-of-Scope: 14
- 1 voted in scope by the group reversing the TG chair's ruling.

Started closing session for TG Maintenance at 5:40 PM.

Motion: *To accept the database 80216-05/015r1 as the comment resolution for the comments from LB#17.*

Forwarded by: Jose Puthenkulam

Seconded by: J.-Pierre Lamoureux

In favor: 30

Opposed: 0

Abstentions: 0

⇒ Motion passes.

Motion: *To authorize the editor to modify the draft P802.16-2004/Cor1/D1 according the resolutions in 80216-05/015r1 to generate draft P802.16-2004/Cor1/D2.*

Forward by: Frank Draper

Seconded: Gordon Antonello

In favor: 25

Opposed: 0

Abstentions: 0

⇒ Motion passes.

Discussed the schedule for the P802.16-2004/Cor1 project. The original schedule is at <http://10.0.1.16/maint/schedule.html>. It was agreed by the group that the original schedule is too aggressive to be realistic. A new schedule was discussed:

Resolve Letter ballot comments	3/14-3/17, 2005
D2 draft of Corrigenda	4/4/2005
Open recirc Letter ballot on D2 draft	4/4/2005
Close recirc Letter ballot	4/22/2005
Open Call for reply comments on Letter ballot recirc comments	4/23/2005
Close Call for reply comments on Letter ballot recirc comment	4/30//2005
Resolve Letter ballot recirc comments	5/2-5/5,2005
D3 draft of Corrigendum	5/12/2005
Conditional approval by 802 EC to go to Sponsor Ballot	5/12/2005
Open confirmation Letter Ballot on D3 draft	5/12/2005
Close confirmation Letter Ballot	5/27/2005
Open Sponsor Ballot	5/29/2005
Close Sponsor Ballot	6/28/2005
Open Call for reply comment on Sponsor Ballot comments	6/30/2005
Close Call for reply comments on Sponsor Ballot comments	7/15/2005
Resolve Sponsor Ballot Comments	July 18-21
802 EC conditional approval to forward to RevCom	7/22/2005
D4 draft of Corrigendum	7/29/2005
Open Sponsor Ballot Recirc	7/29/2005
RevCom Submittal	8/12/2005
Close Sponsor Ballot Recirc	8/13/2005

It was agreed by the group to present this schedule at the Closing Plenary to discuss with the Working Group.

Motion: *To authorize the Chair to make the following motion at the Closing Plenary: "To accept draft P802.16-2004/Cor1/D1 as modified by the comment resolutions (80216-05/015r1) and open a Working Group Recirculation Letter Ballot on that Draft (P802.16-2004/Cor1/D2)"*

Forwarded by: Ollivier Mont-Reynaud

Seconded: Giulio Cavalli

In favor: 29

Opposed: 0

Abstentions: 0

Motion: To authorize the TG Chair to use the comment resolutions to comments 67, 68, 191, and 200 to draft, in collaboration with the WG Chair, a response to the Request for Interpretation to C. Ashok Kumar Reddy.

Forwarded by: Gordon Antonello

Seconded: Frank Draper

Approved by unanimous voice vote

Motion to adjourn forwarded by Raja Banerjea, and seconded by Gordon Antonello.

Approved by unanimous voice vote.

Adjourned TG Maintenance meeting at 6:10 PM.