

| | | |
|----------------|--|---|
| Project | IEEE 802.16 Broadband Wireless Access Working Group < http://ieee802.org/16 > | |
| Title | Maintenance Task Group Session #50 Minutes | |
| Date Submitted | 2007-07-19 | |
| Source(s) | Jonathan Labs Wavesat, Inc. 1375 Trans-Canada Hwy Dorval, Qc H9P 2W8 Canada | Voice: +1 514 684 0200 x325 E-mail: jlabs@wavesat.com |
| Re: | Maintenance Task Group Session #50 Minutes | |
| Abstract | Maintenance Task Group Session #50 Minutes | |
| Purpose | Maintenance Task Group Session #50 Minutes | |
| Notice | <i>This document does not represent the agreed views of the IEEE 802.16 Working Group or any of its subgroups. It represents only the views of the participants listed in the "Source(s)" field above. It is offered as a basis for discussion. It is not binding on the contributor(s), who reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.</i> | |
| Release | The contributor grants a free, irrevocable license to the IEEE to incorporate material contained in this contribution, and any modifications thereof, in the creation of an IEEE Standards publication; to copyright in the IEEE's name any IEEE Standards publication even though it may include portions of this contribution; and at the IEEE's sole discretion to permit others to reproduce in whole or in part the resulting IEEE Standards publication. The contributor also acknowledges and accepts that this contribution may be made public by IEEE 802.16. | |
| Patent Policy | The contributor is familiar with the IEEE-SA Patent Policy and Procedures: < http://standards.ieee.org/guides/bylaws/sect6-7.html#6 > and < http://standards.ieee.org/guides/opman/sect6.html#6.3 >. Further information is located at < http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-material.html > and < http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat >. | |

Maintenance Task Group Session #50 Minutes

Jonathan Labs

TG Chair

Wavesat, Inc.

Maintenance Task Group

Session #50, San Francisco, CA, USA Hyatt Regency Embarcadero

Editor: Joe Schumacher

Tuesday, July 17, 2007

Room: Garden Room A

8:15: Opened meeting of the Maintenance Task Group

Presented the agenda in IEEE 802.16maint-07/023.

8:21: Motion to approve the agenda (IEEE 802.16maint-06/023): Moved by Herbert Ruck, seconded by Jim Carlo.

Approved by unanimous voice vote.

Reviewed the IEEE Patent Policy: <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.pdf>.

The foregoing information was provided and the five slides were shown.

The chair provided an opportunity for participants to identify patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) that the participant believes may be essential for the use of that standard.

No responses were given.

Presented the remaining slides in IEEE 802.16maint-07/023.

8:40: Motion to approve minutes from Session 49 (IEEE 802.16maint-07/016r1): Moved by Dov Andelman, seconded by Giovanni Maggi.

No discussions on the motion.

Motion accepted by unanimous voice vote.

8:42 Started discussion on the ETSI Liaison statement L802.16-07/043.

Issues raised during the discussion:

- Could ETSI put two sets of reference in their documents, one set referring to table, figure, section numbers in the original 802.16 documents, and one in the new document, in this case Rev2?
- The TG Editor will investigate what constraints there are from IEEE style rules.
- Trying to keep track of a “mapping” table between old and new numbers is a great deal of work and may not be possible to automate.
- Searching table, figure and section titles in Adobe goes a long way to resolve the references
- It may be possible to limit the changes by including chapter/section numbers as part of table and figure numbers. But it may create havoc when it is necessary to move them around. This issue to be investigated by the TG Editor

TG Editor volunteered to draft up some paragraphs for a reply letter by Wednesday morning.

9:00 Started resolving the editorial comments in 80216maint-07_020.cmt.

10:05 Broke for coffee

10:30 Resumed meeting.

9:00 Head count (to determine room requirements for Session #50 in San Francisco): 15 people

10:08 Break for coffee.

10:30 Resume after coffee.

12:01 Broke for lunch.

12:03 TG chair and TG Editor generated 80216maint-07_020_temp01.cmt, which contains the comment resolutions as of Tuesday noon plus 5 late comments; database uploaded to the temp local directory.

13:35 TG chair generated 80216maint-07_020_temp02.cmt, to include one additional late comment; database uploaded to the temp local directory.

13:50 Resumed meeting after lunch break.

Resumed comment resolution on 80216maint-07_020_temp02.cmt.

15:02 Broke for coffee

15:20 Resumed after coffee break

17:50 Recessed until Wednesday afternoon, 13:30.

17: 51 TG Editor generated 80216maint-07_020_temp03.cmt, containing the comment resolutions as of Tuesday, July 17, 18:00. Uploaded the database to the temp directory.

Wednesday, July 18, 2007

Room: Garden Room A

13:40 Resumed meeting.

13:50 Resumed discussion on Liaison statement L802.16-07/043

TG Editor presented a draft letter to respond to Liaison statement L802.16-07/043.

The draft letter was discussed and modified in order to complete it and in order to not sound apologetic about the issue of having to renumber sections, tables and figures in P802.16-Rev2.

14:25 Phil Barber calls the question. 8 in favor 4 opposed. The question is called.

Reissued the letter as IEEE 802.16maint-07/025 and uploaded it to the Maintenance directory on the local server.

14:32 Motion to forward IEEE 802.16maint-07/025 to the WG as the response to Liaison statement L802.16-07/043. Forwarded Phil Barber Second: Dan Gal
In favour: 13

Opposed: 0

Abstains: 0

14:40 Discussion on the schedule for the Revision 2 project started.

Jim Carlo presented to the group the IEEE-SA Standards Board operations manual

<http://standards.ieee.org/guides/opman/sb-om.pdf>, specifically section 9.2 on Revisions, to review with the task group what Revision project means.

After some discussion three options were developed, as to how to proceed on the Rev2 project between sessions #50 and #51:

1. Incorporate editorial comment resolutions and 16g into Rev2, generate Rev2/D0d and issue a call for editorial comments, which are to be resolved at Session #51.
2. Incorporate editorial comment resolutions and 16g into Rev2, generate Rev2/D1 and initiate LB#26. Resolve LB comments at Session #51.
3. Incorporate editorial comment resolutions in to Rev2, and initiate LB #26. Resolve LB comments at Session #51.

After additional discussion option #3 was eliminated by consensus. Certain members did not want option #2, due to lack of time for review of the large document between the two sessions. As a compromise, a proposal was put forward to make a motion requesting that the first recirculation of the letter ballot be a minimum of 30 days and that the entire draft (Rev2/D2) would be open for review.

16:30 Chair ends the discussion on the schedule in order that a set of motions could be drafted, and to reissue the database IEEE 802.16maint-07/020_temp04 as IEEE 802.16maint-07/020r1. The database was reissued and uploaded to the Maintenance directory on the local server.

16:40 TG Chair presents the slides in IEEE 802.16maint-07/024:

- IEEE 802.16maint-07/020r1 (in Maint upload dir)
 - 104 comments (7 late comments)
 - 0 Technical binding
 - 0 Technical non-binding
 - 104 Editorial
 - 0 new contributions
 - Resolution summary:
 - 71 Accepted or Accepted-modified
 - 17 Rejected (14 determined by the TG to be Technical)
 - 6 Withdrawn
 - 10 Superseded

Motion at 16:32: To accept the database IEEE 802.16maint-07/020r1 as the comment resolutions for the editorial call for comments on P802.16-Rev2/D0b.

Forwarded by: John Humbert

Seconded by: Jim Carlo

No discussions on the motion.

Vote on the motion:

In favor: 18

Against: 0

Abstain: 0

Motion Passes

Motion at 16:34: To authorize the editor to generate the document P802.16Rev2/D0c according to the resolutions in IEEE 802.16maint-07/020r1.

Forwarded by: Dov Andelman
Seconded by: Joe Schumacher

No discussions on the motion.

Vote on the motion:

In favor: 19

Against: 0

Abstain: 0

Motion passes

Motion at 16:36: To authorize the editor to incorporate P802.16g/D9 into the document P802.16-Rev2/D0c, and generate P802.16-Rev2/D0d.

Forwarded by: John Humbert
Seconded by: Jim Carlo

No discussions on the motion.

Vote on the motion:

In favor: 18

Against: 0

Abstain: 0

Motion passes

Motion at 16:51: To authorize the TG Chair to make the following motion at the IEEE 802.16 Working Group Session #50 Closing Plenary:

“To authorize the editor to modify P802.16-Rev2/D0b according to the comment resolutions in IEEE 802.16maint-07/020r1 to generate P802.16-Rev2/D0c, and to incorporate draft P802.16g/D9 to generate P802.16-Rev2/D0d.”

Forwarded by: Dan Gal
Seconded by: Phil Barber

Discussion on the motion: clarification was made that this motion was required if the letter ballot would be opened on the Rev2 document.

In favor: 15

Against: 0

Abstain: 0

Motion passes

Motion at 17:35: To authorize the TG Chair to make the following motion at the IEEE 802.16 Working Group Session #50 Closing Plenary:

*“To approve the document P802.16-Rev2/D0d as the Working Group draft, reissuing the document as P802.16-Rev2/D1, and to initiate a Working Group Letter Ballot on that draft;
To open the entire subsequent draft, P802.16Rev2/D2, for a 30 day minimum Letter Ballot recirculation.”*

Forwarded by: Phil Barber
Seconded by: Joe Schumacher

Discussion followed. A number of members were still opposed to initiating the letter ballot between Session #50 and #51, and rather just wanted an editorial review of the Rev 2 document, to check that P802.16g was incorporated correctly. Other members felt that it was time to get moving on the project and start the Letter Ballot, also so as not to postpone the development of the Revision (and thereby not delay other projects like 802.16j and 802.16m), and so that more work can be done at Session #51.

17:33 Jim Carlo calls the question. Question was called by silent consent.

Vote on the motion:

In favor: 7

Against: 9

Abstain: 2

Motion fails

17:45 New business

Dan Gal asked if it was okay to introduce technical contributions for discussion. TG chair explained technical contributions can be brought forward at any time for discussion.

John Humbert asked the status of comments in the Maintenance process. TG chair took the action item to determine how many comments remain in the maintenance Change Request database, and to ask the original submitters if any CR's could be withdrawn.

The TG editor asked the members what the 'delta' documents should reflect in terms of highlighted changes. It was clarified to the editor that the highlighted changes should always show only the differences between two sequential versions of Rev 2 document.

17:49: Motion to adjourn forwarded by Dov Andelman, seconded Dan Gal. Motion passes by unanimous voice vote.