

Project	IEEE 802.16 Broadband Wireless Access Working Group < http://ieee802.org/16 >	
Title	Maintenance Task Group Session #53 Minutes	
Date Submitted	2008-01-31	
Source(s)	Jonathan Labs Wavesat, Inc. 1375 Trans-Canada Hwy Dorval, Qc H9P 2W8 Canada	Voice: +1 514 684 0200 x325 E-mail: jlabs@wavesat.com
Re:	Maintenance Task Group Session #53 Minutes	
Abstract	Maintenance Task Group Session #53 Minutes	
Purpose	Maintenance Task Group Session #53 Minutes	
Notice	<i>This document does not represent the agreed views of the IEEE 802.16 Working Group or any of its subgroups. It represents only the views of the participants listed in the "Source(s)" field above. It is offered as a basis for discussion. It is not binding on the contributor(s), who reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.</i>	
Release	The contributor grants a free, irrevocable license to the IEEE to incorporate material contained in this contribution, and any modifications thereof, in the creation of an IEEE Standards publication; to copyright in the IEEE's name any IEEE Standards publication even though it may include portions of this contribution; and at the IEEE's sole discretion to permit others to reproduce in whole or in part the resulting IEEE Standards publication. The contributor also acknowledges and accepts that this contribution may be made public by IEEE 802.16.	
Patent Policy	The contributor is familiar with the IEEE-SA Patent Policy and Procedures: < http://standards.ieee.org/guides/bylaws/sect6-7.html#6 > and < http://standards.ieee.org/guides/opman/sect6.html#6.3 >. Further information is located at < http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-material.html > and < http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat >.	

Maintenance Task Group Session #53 Minutes

Jonathan Labs
TG Chair
Wavesat, Inc.

Maintenance Task Group
Session #53, Levi, Finland, Hotel Hullu Poro

Chief Editor: Joe Schumacher

Monday, January 21, 2008

Room: Talvi

17:10: Opened meeting of the Maintenance Task Group

Presented the agenda in IEEE 802.16maint-08/002.

17:18: Motion to approve the agenda (IEEE 802.16maint-08/002): Moved by Lei Wang, seconded by Itzik Kitroser.

Approved by unanimous voice vote.

Reviewed the IEEE Patent Policy: <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.pdf>.

The foregoing information was provided and the five slides were shown.

The chair provided an opportunity for participants to identify patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) that the participant believes may be essential for the use of that standard.

One identification was given: Ayman Naguib identifies that Qualcomm may have IP that would impact the practice of the standard. If they do, Qualcomm will comply with all patent policies in IEEE in a timely manner.

Reviewed the minutes

17:31: Motion to approve minutes from Session 52 (IEEE 802.16maint-07/036r1): Moved by Erik Colban, seconded by Ayman Naguib.

No discussions on the motion.

Motion accepted by unanimous voice vote.

Presented the remaining slides in IEEE 802.16maint-08/002.

17:45: TG Chair recesses the Maintenance Task Group for the evening.

18:15: TG Chair uploaded IEEE 802.16maint-07/036r1 to the Maint directory.

18:30 TG Chair generated IEEE 802.16-08/001r1_temp01, containing late reply comments from two individuals, and uploaded the file to the temp directory on the internet.

23:30 TG Chair generated reply comments to flag LB #26a comments associated with MIMO, VoIP and H-FDD/FDD material, add them to the database 802.16-08/001r1_temp01 to generate 802.16-08/001r1_temp02, which was then uploaded to the temp upload directory on the internet.

Tuesday, January 22, 2008

Room: Talvi

8:39 Resumed meeting.

Reminded the Task Group that the IEEE patent policy is in effect.

Started comment resolution of IEEE 802.16-08/001r1_temp02, starting with technically binding comments.

10:17 Broke for coffee

10:33 Resumed meeting

12:03 Broke for lunch

TG Editor generated IEEE 802.16-08/001r1_temp03, which contains comment resolutions as of Tuesday 12:03 PM on LB#26a, and uploaded the database to the temp directory on the internet.

13:16 Resumed meeting

Resumed comment resolution of 802.16-08/001r1_temp03, with the technically binding comments (specifically comment 1010 and 1011).

15:12 Broke for coffee

15:26 Resumed meeting.

18:12 Recessed for dinner.

19:30 TG Chair labelled comments associated with MBS with late reply comments, generate 802.16-08/001r1_temp04 and uploaded the database to the temp directory on the internet.

20:05 Resumed meeting. Resumed comment resolution on 802.16-08/001r1_temp04, specifically comments labelled by the chair as Netman material.

23:15 Broke for the night.

TG Editor generated IEEE 802.16-08/001r1_temp05, which contains the comment resolutions as of Tuesday, 23:15 PM on LB#26a, and uploaded the database to the temp directory on the internet.

Wednesday, January 23, 2008

Room: Talvi

8:36 Resumed meeting.

Reminded the Task Group that the IEEE patent policy is in effect.

Resumed comment resolution of IEEE 802.16-08/001r1_temp05, with the technically binding comments.

10:15 Broke for coffee

10:30 Resumed meeting

Motion to reject comment 1125 as originally stated. Forwarded by Itzik Kitroser, seconded Erik Colban. In favour 15, opposed 0, motion passes.

12:15 Break for lunch

TG Editor generated IEEE 802.16-08/001r1_temp06, which contains the comment resolutions as of Wednesday, 12:15 noon on LB#26a. TG Chair flagged additional comments in the database associated with MIMO and uploaded the database to the temp directory on the internet.

13:30 Resumed after lunch.

Resumed comments resolution on LB #26a with database IEEE802.16-08/001r1_temp06.

15:30 Broke for coffee

15:42 Resumed meeting.

18:56 Broke for dinner social.

TG Editor generated IEEE 802.16-08/001r1_temp07, which contains the comment resolutions as of Wednesday, 6:56 PM on LB#26a. The TG Chair flagged comments associated with Hand-over via the reply comments and uploaded the database to the temp directory on the internet.

22:10 Resumed meeting.

Resumed comment resolution with database IEEE 802.16-08/001r1_temp07, specifically on MBS comments.

23:15 TG Chair asked if there was any objection to extending the meeting until completion of the MBS comments or midnight, whichever comes first. No objection was given.

23:25 Hotel staff requested the group to vacate the room for the night.

23:30 Broke for the evening.

21:45 Started reviewing the technically non-binding comments.

22:32 Recessed for the night.

22:35 TG Editor generated IEEE 802.16-08/001r1_temp08, which contains the comment resolutions as of Wednesday, 11:30 PM on LB#26a, and the TG Chair uploaded the database to the temp directory on the internet.

Thursday, January 24, 2008

Room: Talvi

8:15 Resumed meeting.

Reminded the Task Group that the IEEE patent policy is in effect.

Resumed comment resolution of IEEE 802.16-08/001r1_temp08, finishing the comments on MBS, to be followed by comments on FDD/H-FDD.

12:30 Broke for lunch.

12:31 TG Editor generated IEEE 802.16-08/001r1_temp09, which contains the comment resolutions as of Thursday, 12:30 PM on LB#26a. The TG Chair uploaded the database to the temp directory on the internet.

13:30 Resumed meeting.

Resumed comments resolution on IEEE 802.16-08/001r1_temp09.

14:30 Motion: To reject comments 1096,1106, 1107, 1062, 1114 in IEEE 802.16-08/001r1_temp09 on the due to incomplete remedies. David Johnston, Geunhwi Lim 16 infavor, 0 against. Motion passes.

15:46: motion to accept comment 1128 as originally stated. Forwarded by David Johnston, second Phil Barber 9 in favor, 0 against, motion passes.

15:56 Roll Call vote called.

15:59 Roll Call vote recalled.

17:50 Task Group Chair extends meeting until the business of the group for the week is completed. The update to the schedule was accepted by silent consent.

18:00 TG broke for 10 minutes to vacate the Talvi room as preparation of the room by the hotel staff was needed for the 802.16 Closing Plenary

18:10 Reconvened in the Poron Pirtti Room in Building 8.

Resumed comment resolution on IEEE 802.16-08/001r1_temp09.

18:55 Motion to accept all editorial comments listed in contribution C802.16maint-08/036r2. Forwarded by Phil Barber, second Erik Colban. 15 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstain. Motion passes.

19:00 Closed the database IEEE 802.16-08/001r1_temp09 and generated IEEE 802.16-08/001r2. Distributed the database among the group through a memory stick as the wireless internet was not working in the room.

19:10 Start 802.16 Maintenance closing. No slides presented.

Statistics from comment resolution in IEEE 802.16maint-08/001r2

– 403 comments (2 late comments)

- 223 Technical binding
- 43 Editorial binding
- 81 Technical non-binding
- 54 Editorial
- 1 Other
- 1 General
- 64 technical contribution
- Resolution summary:
 - 222 Accepted or Accepted-modified
 - 119 Rejected
 - 6 Withdrawn
 - 54 Superseded
 - No late comments resolved.

19:05: Motion: To accept the database IEEE 802.16-08/001r2 as the comment resolutions from LB#26a.

Forwarded by: Erik Colban

Seconded by: Joe Schumacher

In favor: 13

Against: 0

Abstain: 0

Motion Passes

19:06: Motion: To authorize the editor to generate the document P802.16Rev2/D3 according to the resolutions in IEEE 802.16-08/001r2.

Forwarded by: Phil Barber

Seconded by: Brian Shim

In favor: 14

Against: 0

Abstain: 0

Motion Passes

19:08: Motion: To authorize the TG Chair to make the following motion at the IEEE 802.16 Working Group Session #53 Closing Plenary:

“To accept draft P802.16-Rev2/D2 as modified by the comment resolutions (80216-08/001r2) and open a Working Group Recirculation Letter Ballot on the Draft (P802.16-Rev2/D3).”

Forwarded by: Wonil Roh

Seconded by: Erik Colban

In favor: 14

Against: 0

Abstain: 0

Motion Passes

Discussed 21 February as a hard drop date for the Rev2/D3 draft in order to have a 2 week recirc ballot period and 1 week reply comment period. Agreed to say 18 February as the target date for the release.

19:23 New business: TG Chair asked if there were any new business that anyone would like to bring up at this time. No new business was raised.

19:23 Motion to adjourn, forwarded by Phil Barber, seconded by Erik Colban. Motion passes by unanimous voice vote.

Note: record of satisfied and non-satisfied comments from the original commenters is in Appendix I.

Appendix I

Satisfied and non-satisfied comments in IEEE 802.16-08/001r2 as indicated by commenters during the Maintenance Task Group sessions:

Comment	Member	Satisfied? (y/n)	Comment resolution
1002	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1003	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1009	Lei Wang	y	accepted
1010	Joe Schumacher	y	superceded 1011
1011	Richard van Leeuwen	y	accepted modified
1028	Yeongmoon Son	n	rejected
1032	Phil Barber	y	accepted
1037	Joe Schumacher	y	accepted
1041	Herbert Ruck	y	accepted
1045	Vladimir Yanover	y	accepted.
1048	Vladimir Yanover	y	accepted modified
1053	Phil Barber	y	accepted-modified
1054	David Comstock	y	accepted-modified
1055	John Humbert	n	rejected
1056	Joe Schumacher	y	accepted-modified
1075	Lei Wang	y	accepted
1076	Geunhwi Lim	y	accepted
1075	Lei Wang	y	accepted
1076	Geunhwi Lim	y	accepted
1077	Vladimir Yanover	y	accepted-modified
1083	Dan Gal	n	rejected
1085	Peretz Feder	y	accepted
1089	Joe Schumacher	y	accepted
1090	Joe Schumacher	y	accepted
1091	Joe Schumacher	y	accepted
1092	Joe Schumacher	y	accepted
1093	Joe Schumacher	y	accepted
1105	Joe Schumacher	y	accepted
1108	Yeongmoon Son	y	accepted
1110	Phil Barber	y	accepted-modified
1111	Brian Shim	n	rejected
1113	Vladimir Yanover	y	accepted
1115	Vladimir Yanover	y	accepted-modified
1116	Vladimir Yanover	y	accepted-modified
1117	Vladimir Yanover	y	accepted
1118	Vladimir Yanover	y	accepted
1119	Vladimir Yanover	y	accepted-modified
1121	Vladimir Yanover	y	accepted
1126	Vladimir Yanover	n	rejected
1127	Vladimir Yanover	y	accepted
1128	Vladimir Yanover	y	accepted
1133	Vladimir Yanover	y	accepted-modified
1135	Erik Colban	y	accepted-modified
1136	Vladimir Yanover	y	accepted-modified

1140	Joe Schumacher	n	rejected
1142	Dan Gal	y	superceded
1143	Dan Gal	y	superceded
1144	Dan Gal	y	accepted-modified
1147	Dan Gal	y	accepted
1152	Joe Schumacher	n	rejected
1153	Dan Gal	y	accepted
1156	Peretz Feder	y	accepted
1157	Dan Gal	y	accepted
1158	Peretz Feder	y	accepted
1165	Peiyong Zhu	y	accepted-modified
1168	Peiyong Zhu	y	accepted-modified
1173	Erik Colban	y	accepted-modified
1175	Erik Colban	y	accepted
1188	Erik Colban	n	rejected
1195	Lei Wang	y	superceded
1204	Herbert Ruck	y	accepted-modified
1206	Gokhan Korkmaz	n	rejected
1207	Erik Colban	y	accepted
1219	Herbert Ruck	n	rejected
1225	Joe Schumacher	y	accepted
1226	Herbert Ruck	y	accepted
1227	Gokhan Korkmaz	y	superceded
1233	Peiyong Zhu	y	accepted-modified
1234	Gokhan Korkmaz	n	accepted-modified
1246	Wonil Roh	y	accepted
1251	Erik Colban	y	accepted-modified
1258	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1259	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1261	Brian Shim	y	accepted-modified
1262	Phil Barber	y	accepted
1266	Joe Schumacher	y	accepted
1272	Phil Barber	y	accepted
1274	Joe Schumacher	y	accepted-modified
1279	Peiyong Zhu	n	rejected
1281	Phil Barber	y	accepted
1282	Richard van Leeuwen	y	accepted
1293	Joe Schumacher	y	accepted
1291	Phil Barber	y	accepted
1292	Phil Barber	y	accepted
1293	Phil Barber	y	accepted
1294	Joe Schumacher	y	accepted
1295	Phil Barber	y	accepted
1296	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1297	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1298	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1299	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1300	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1308	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1310	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1318	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1325	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1329	Joey Chou	y	accepted

1330	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1331	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1332	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1333	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1334	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1335	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1336	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1338	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1339	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1340	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1341	Joey Chou	n	rejected
1342	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1343	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1344	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1345	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1347	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1348	Joey Chou	y	accepted-modified
1349	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1350	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1351	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1352	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1353	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1354	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1356	Joey Chou	y	rejected
1358	Herbert Ruck	y	accepted
1359	Herbert Ruck	y	accepted
1360	Herbert Ruck	y	accepted
1361	Herbert Ruck	y	accepted
1365	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1366	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1368	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1370	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1371	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1372	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1373	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1374	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1375	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1376	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1377	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1379	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1380	Joey Chou	y	accepted-modified
1381	Joey Chou	y	accepted-modified
1382	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1383	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1384	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1385	Herbert Ruck	y	accepted
1386	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1387	Joey Chou	y	accepted-modified
1388	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1390	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1392	Joey Chou	y	accepted
1394	Joey Chou	n	rejected
1398	Gokhan Korkmaz	n	rejected

